

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-11875-0 - The Politics of Protest in Hybrid Regimes: Managing Dissent in Post-Communist Russia

Graeme B. Robertson

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

The Politics of Protest in Hybrid Regimes

Since the end of the Cold War, more and more countries feature political regimes that are neither liberal democracies nor closed authoritarian systems. Most research on these hybrid regimes focuses on how elites manipulate elections to stay in office, but in places as diverse as Bolivia, Georgia, Kyrgyzstan, Serbia, Thailand, Ukraine, and Venezuela, protest in the streets has been at least as important as elections in determining the fate of governments. *The Politics of Protest in Hybrid Regimes* builds on previously unpublished data and extensive fieldwork in Russia to show how one high-profile hybrid regime manages political competition in the workplace and in the streets. More generally, the book develops a theory of how the nature of organizations in society, state strategies for mobilizing supporters, and elite competition shape political protest in hybrid regimes.

Graeme B. Robertson is Assistant Professor of Political Science at the University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill. His research focuses on labor, social movements, political protest, and the problems of governance in authoritarian regimes. He has published articles in the *American Political Science Review*, *Comparative Politics*, the *Slavic Review*, *Communist and Post-Communist Studies*, *Pro et Contra*, and the *Journal of Democracy*.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-11875-0 - The Politics of Protest in Hybrid Regimes: Managing Dissent in Post-Communist Russia

Graeme B. Robertson

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

The Politics of Protest in Hybrid Regimes

Managing Dissent in Post-Communist Russia

GRAEME B. ROBERTSON

University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-11875-0 - The Politics of Protest in Hybrid Regimes: Managing Dissent in Post-Communist Russia

Graeme B. Robertson

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore,
São Paulo, Delhi, Dubai, Tokyo, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press

32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521118750

© Graeme B. Robertson 2011

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2011

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data

Robertson, Graeme B., 1969–

The politics of protest in hybrid regimes : managing dissent in post-communist Russia / Graeme B. Robertson.

p. cm.

ISBN 978-0-521-11875-0 (hardback)

1. Dissenters – Russia (Federation) 2. Protest movements – Russia (Federation)

3. Russia (Federation) – Politics and government – 1991– I. Title.

DK510.763.R63 2010

322.40947–dc22 2010031357

ISBN 978-0-521-11875-0 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-11875-0 - The Politics of Protest in Hybrid Regimes: Managing Dissent in Post-Communist Russia

Graeme B. Robertson

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

*To George and Ena Robertson,
for their example, encouragement, and unconditional love.*

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-11875-0 - The Politics of Protest in Hybrid Regimes: Managing Dissent in Post-Communist Russia

Graeme B. Robertson

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

“[a scholar] begins timidly, moderately, he begins by asking a most modest question: ‘is it not from here? Does not a certain country derive its name from that particular place? ... He immediately quotes such and such ancient writers, and as soon as he detects some kind of a hint, or something that he believes to be a hint, he at once becomes emboldened and self-confident, talks to the writers of antiquity like an old friend, puts questions to them and supplies the answers himself, forgetting completely that he has begun with a timid supposition; he already believes that he can see it all, that everything is clear and his argument is concluded with the words: “So that is how it was ...”. Then he proclaims it *ex cathedra*, for all to hear, and the newly discovered truth is sent traveling all over the world, gathering followers and disciples.”

–Nikolai Gogol, *Dead Souls*

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-11875-0 - The Politics of Protest in Hybrid Regimes: Managing Dissent in Post-Communist Russia

Graeme B. Robertson

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Contents

<i>List of Tables</i>	page xi
<i>List of Figures</i>	xiii
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xv
Introduction	I
<i>Hybrid Regimes</i>	4
<i>Russian Lessons and a Theory of Protest in Hybrids</i>	6
<i>Theoretical Implications</i>	8
<i>Literature on Contentious Politics and Social</i>	
<i>Movements</i>	8
<i>Industrial Conflict</i>	11
<i>Hybrid Regimes and Repression</i>	11
<i>Politics in Russia through the Lens of Protest</i>	13
<i>Structure of the Book</i>	16
1 Protest and Regimes: Organizational Ecology, Mobilization	
Strategies, and Elite Competition	18
<i>How Regimes Affect Contention</i>	19
<i>Protest in Democracies</i>	19
<i>Protest in Closed Autocracies</i>	20
<i>Protest in Hybrid Regimes</i>	22
<i>Organizational Ecology</i>	24
<i>State Mobilizing Strategies</i>	30
<i>Elite Competition</i>	34
<i>Summary of Regime Effects on Contention</i>	35
<i>How Contention Affects Regimes</i>	38
2 Protest and Regime in Russia	40
<i>Post-Communism and Protest</i>	42
<i>Data on Protest</i>	44
<i>What, Who, and Why</i>	49
<i>Protest Repertoires</i>	51
	vii

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-11875-0 - The Politics of Protest in Hybrid Regimes: Managing Dissent in Post-Communist Russia

Graeme B. Robertson

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

viii

Contents

	<i>Protest Participants</i>	55
	<i>Nature of the Demands Made</i>	59
	<i>Conclusion: Protests without Movements</i>	62
3	The Geography of Strikes	67
	<i>Strike Patterns</i>	69
	<i>The Ecology of Organizations and Protest</i>	72
	<i>Labor: Trading Cooperation for Survival</i>	73
	<i>Social Partnership at the Regional Level</i>	75
	<i>Mobilization Strategies, Elite Competition, and Strike Patterns</i>	79
	<i>Hypotheses and Measures</i>	81
	<i>Political Power</i>	81
	<i>Other Resources</i>	82
	<i>Capacity</i>	83
	<i>Alternative Explanations: Business Cycles, Information, and Hardship</i>	84
	<i>Strike Data</i>	87
	<i>Models and Results</i>	88
	<i>Other Forms of Protest</i>	94
	<i>Organizational Realities and Hybrid Regimes</i>	97
4	A Time for Trouble	100
	<i>Protest and Time</i>	101
	<i>Demonetization, Wage Arrears, and Protest</i>	105
	<i>Center-Periphery Conflict Over Rules and Resources</i>	109
	<i>Primakov's Appointment and Protest Dynamics</i>	112
	<i>Conclusion</i>	123
5	Elections and the Decline of Protest	124
	<i>Political Protest and the Paradox of the 1999 Elections</i>	126
	<i>Theories of Protest Decline</i>	130
	<i>Putin's Political Strategy and Protest Decline</i>	132
	<i>Parallel Elections and the Separation of the National and the Local</i>	137
	<i>Denationalizing Protest</i>	141
	<i>Conclusion: Bandwagons, Protest, and Regime</i>	145
6	Vladimir Putin and Defeat-Proofing the System	147
	<i>Incorporating Labor into the "Vertical"</i>	149
	<i>Enlisting the Regional Political Machines</i>	151
	<i>Defeat-Proofing the Electoral System</i>	155
	<i>A New Electoral Party of Power</i>	156
	<i>Political Product Differentiation: Sponsored Parties</i>	157
	<i>The Insertion of Veto Points</i>	160
	<i>Potential Problems, Sources of Weakness</i>	164

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-11875-0 - The Politics of Protest in Hybrid Regimes: Managing Dissent in Post-Communist Russia

Graeme B. Robertson

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

<i>Contents</i>	ix	
7	Protest, Repression, and Order from Below	167
	<i>Managing Contention in Hybrids</i>	170
	<i>Putin, Protest, and Print Dresses</i>	174
	<i>The Response: Coercion and Channeling</i>	178
	<i>Coercion</i>	179
	<i>Channeling</i>	179
	<i>After the Revolution: The New Politics of the Streets</i>	183
	<i>Coercion in Russia: Brezhnev and Putin</i>	188
	<i>Channeling under Putin</i>	190
	<i>Licensing Civil Society</i>	192
	<i>Filling the Organizational Space: Ersatz Social Movements</i>	194
	<i>Russian Repression in the Broader Context</i>	197
8	Implications for Russia and Elsewhere	200
	<i>Implications for Other Cases</i>	202
	<i>Social Movements, Political Opportunities and</i>	
	<i>Repression in Hybrids</i>	207
	<i>Implications for Russian Politics</i>	210
	<i>Democratization from the Ground Up?</i>	212
	<i>Bibliography</i>	219
	<i>Appendix 1 Event Protocol</i>	237
	<i>Appendix 2 Sectoral and Seasonal Strike Patterns</i>	269
	<i>Appendix 3 A Statistical Approach to Political Relations</i>	275
	<i>Index</i>	279

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-11875-0 - The Politics of Protest in Hybrid Regimes: Managing Dissent in Post-Communist Russia

Graeme B. Robertson

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Tables

1.1.	Summary of Regimes and Their Contention	<i>page</i> 36
1.2.	Organizational Ecology, State Mobilizing Strategies, and Elite Competition in Post-Communist Russia	37
2.1.	Repertoires of Protest in Russia, 1997–2000	54
3.1.	Variation in Working Days Lost to Strikes by Region, 1997–2000	70
3.2.	Summary of Hypotheses and Measures	86
3.3.	Working Days per Month Lost to Strikes in Non-Mining Sectors	89
3.4.	Determinants of Non-Strike Protest Events	95
4.1.	Protest Mobilization in Russian Regions: Strikes	114
4.2.	Determinants of Participation in First Protest Wave (1997) – Logistic Regression	115
4.3.	Determinants of Participation in Second Protest Wave (1998–1999) – Logistic Regression	122
5.1.	Effect of Putin’s Popularity on Protest Events	135
5.2.	Weekly Event Diffusion, January 1997–June 1999	143
5.3.	Weekly Event Diffusion in July–December 1999: Geography and Politics	144
8.1.	Varieties of Contention in Hybrid Regimes	204
A2.1.	Sectoral Breakdown of Working Days Lost to Strikes	270
A2.2.	Breakdown of Strikes Outside of Education, Health, and Mining	270
A2.3.	Industrial Strikes	271
A2.4.	Service Sector Strikes Outside Health and Education	272
A2.5.	Strikes in the Budget and Non-Budget Sectors	273
A3.1.	Determinants of the MKF Renaissance Index of Governors’ Relations with Moscow	276

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-11875-0 - The Politics of Protest in Hybrid Regimes: Managing Dissent in Post-Communist Russia

Graeme B. Robertson

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Figures

2.1.	MVD and Goskomstat estimates of working days lost to strikes, 1997–2000	<i>page</i> 48
2.2.	International strike comparisons, 1997–2000	50
2.3.	Participants in protest events, 1997–2000	56
2.4.	Workers protests by sector, 1997–2000	56
2.5.	Participants in protest events excluding workers, 1997–2000	57
2.6.	Categories of demands made at protest events in the Russian Federation, 1997–2000	61
2.7.	Demands other than for payment of legal obligations made at protest events in the Russian Federation, 1997–2000	61
2.8.	Scope of demands made at protest events in the Russian Federation, 1997–2000	62
2.9.	Scope of demands excluding payment of legal obligations made at protest events in the Russian Federation, 1997–2000	63
2.10.	Number of demonstrators in the Russian Federation, 1997–2000	64
3.1.	Regional variation in strike intensity in the Russian Federation, 1997–2000	71
4.1.	Working days lost to strikes in the Russian Federation, 1997–2000	102
4.2.	Patterns of days lost to strikes and hunger strikes in the Russian Federation, 1997–2000	103
4.3.	Patterns of protest events in the Russian Federation, 1997–2000	104

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-11875-0 - The Politics of Protest in Hybrid Regimes: Managing Dissent in Post-Communist Russia

Graeme B. Robertson

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

xiv

Figures

4.4. Temporal patterns of strikes and wage arrears in the Russian Federation, 1997–2000	107
4.5. Strikes in 1998–1999 wave regions only	116
4.6. Strikes and wage arrears in 1998–1999 wave	121
5.1. Temporal patterns of protest in the Russian Federation, 1999–2000	128
5.2. Working days lost to strikes in the Russian Federation, 1999–2000	129
A2.1. Seasonal patterns outside of education	273

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-11875-0 - The Politics of Protest in Hybrid Regimes: Managing Dissent in Post-Communist Russia

Graeme B. Robertson

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Acknowledgments

In writing this book, I have benefited enormously from the advice and support of colleagues, teachers, friends, and family on three continents. The book began as a dissertation project at Columbia University, and both the book and my approach to the study of politics, more generally, were profoundly shaped by the people with whom I had the great fortune to work there. Columbia was a perfect environment for a graduate student of catholic tastes, with a faculty spanning a broad range of approaches in political science, sociology, history, and baseball. Although I learned a lot from many people there, I owe particular thanks to several: Steven Solnick, who helped me think about both the project and the profession in the earliest stages, Robert Amdur, Chuck Cameron, Ira Katznelson, Mark Kesselman, Bob Legvold, Nolan McCarty, Andy Nathan, Bob Shapiro, and Greg Wawro. Institutionally within Columbia, the Institute for Social and Economic Research and Policy provided invaluable resources, office space, and intellectual encouragement. I am particularly grateful to Peter Berman for his energy and support, and to my dear friend Bill McAllister for his generosity, kindness, and extraordinary ability to see the big picture and the details at the same time.

Like so many others, I owe an enormous debt to the great Chuck Tilly whose influence will be obvious to all who read the text and even more to those who knew the man. It was an exceptional privilege to have a chance to learn from Chuck and to have the opportunity to try to follow his example. At Columbia, I was also privileged to have another extraordinary mentor, Al Stepan. Al is rightly famous for his energy, curiosity, and amazing breadth of knowledge. In addition, he achieves the barely credible feat of making political science seem glamorous.

In developing the book since my time at Columbia, I have been enormously assisted by colleagues at the Center for the Study of Democratic Politics at Princeton University, at the Centro de Investigación y Docencia Económicas (CIDE) in Mexico City, at the Kellogg Institute at Notre Dame University, and at my principal home for the last six years, the University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill. At each of these institutions, I have enjoyed the gift of great

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-11875-0 - The Politics of Protest in Hybrid Regimes: Managing Dissent in Post-Communist Russia

Graeme B. Robertson

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

friendship and support, not to mention terrific advice on political science. In addition to many others, I owe thanks to Chris Achen, Larry Bartels, Dawn Brancati, Shigeo Hirano, Keena Lipsitz, Nolan McCarty (again), Grigore Pop-Eleches, Diane Price, and Josh Tucker at Princeton; to Fabrice Lehoucq, Covadonga Meseguer, and Andreas Schedler at CIDE; and to Robert Fishman, Debra Javeline, Scott Mainwaring, and Samuel Valenzuela at Notre Dame. UNC at Chapel Hill has been a wonderful place to work, and I am indebted to the many colleagues and friends there who have helped with the book and everything else. I am especially indebted to my colleagues in the Political Science Department and at The Center for Slavic, Eurasian and East European Research for their friendship and collegiality.

Financial assistance for the research was provided by Columbia University, the Center for Study of Democratic Politics at Princeton University, the Spray-Randleigh Foundation at the University of North Carolina, and the National Science Foundation (Award Number 0136980). I am grateful to Sam Greene, Henry Hale, Jonathan Hartlyn, Tom Kenyon, and Charlie Kurzman for insightful reading of parts of the manuscript, and to Milada Vachudova for her invaluable contributions over several readings. Two anonymous reviewers also provided very helpful suggestions. Heather Sullivan provided excellent research assistance.

I thank Lew Bateman and Anne Lovering Rounds at Cambridge University Press and Jayashree Prabhu at Newgen for their encouragement and patience. Parts of Chapter 3 and Chapter 7 were previously published in the *American Political Science Review* and the *Slavic Review*. I thank Cambridge and the *Slavic Review* for permission to use this material here.

In Russia, I owe too many debts over too long a time to remember them all. In Moscow, I am particularly grateful to Tatiana Gorbacheva, Sergei Khramov and the people at Sotsprof, Frank Hoffer, Vladimir Lazerev, Irena Perova, Sergei Roshin, Alan Rouso, Evgenii Siderov, Irene Stevenson, and Aleksei Titkov. I also thank Simon and Geraldine for their hospitality, which made coming back from Siberia such fun. In Irkutsk, I thank Vladimir Kazarenko, Aleksandr Obolkin, Evgenii Pavlov, Anna Turchaninova, Sergei Zaderaka, and “Madame” and her family. In Novosibirsk, I thank Pavel Taletskii, German Vinokurov, and especially Maksim and Nastia. In Vladivostok, Mikhail Alekseev and Katya Burns helped me meet the right people and get oriented, and Viktor Babykin, Alefena Grigorievna, Viktor Kaurov, Petr Kerasov, Ivan Rogovoi, Aliona Sokolova, and the journalists of *Vladivostok News*, Vladimir Utinko, Tamara Vadileva, Elena Vankina, and Oleg Zhurusov all provided assistance. More recently, I am deeply indebted to Sarah Lindemann-Komarova, to Vanya, and to everyone at *Vozrozhdenie* in the Altai Republic. I am also extremely grateful to Stewart Griffin for his energy, enthusiasm, support, and photographs all across Siberia and the Far East, not to mention the twenty years of friendship. I cannot recommend anyone better for a visit to Nogliki or Swansea.

Much of the fieldwork was done and much of my time in Russia has been spent in St. Petersburg. I am particularly grateful to Andrei Dmitriev, Ol’ga

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-11875-0 - The Politics of Protest in Hybrid Regimes: Managing Dissent in Post-Communist Russia

Graeme B. Robertson

Frontmatter

[More information](#)*Acknowledgments*

xvii

Kurnosova, and Maksim Reznik for their repeated help and insights and especially to Mikhail Druzhininskii for his exceptional generosity of spirit, his time, and his amazing archive. The highlight of any visit to St. Petersburg is, of course, the “Quiet River Bed and Breakfast.” I thank Deniska, Anya, Aliosha, and my dear, dear friend Olik for the fun, cultural programs, and general *prelest*’ over the years. According to Bishop Ignatius Brianchaninov, “General *prelest*’ is forgetting and not noticing one’s sinfulness.” Sounds about right.

Most of the second half of the book was written in Mexico City, where I am grateful for the love and care of my friends and my extraordinary family: Ceci and Alec, Lore and Hugh, Rafa and Lourdes, and the Palacios. I thank Roberto for many interesting early-morning conversations about the book and other topics, and for the hospitality (and unusual entertainment) he and Daniela provided.

This book, of course, has been longer in gestation than even the years in which I was consciously working on it. I owe a great debt to a number of early teachers, most prominently, Vic Hadcroft who taught me Latin, Greek, and the subversive value of education; Dr. Robert Currie who taught a generation of students the crucial (and eternal) lesson that “it’s tough at the top in the Soviet Union”; and Dr Mary McAuley who made me want to understand what happened after the Soviet experiment. Less directly but more importantly, I am grateful to my family. My grandmother, Polly Beacom, did more to shape my thinking than she could ever have imagined (or perhaps wished). I am grateful to Murray, Keith, and Lesley for their love over the years, and to my parents, to whom this book is dedicated, for everything.

I am grateful both for and to Tomás, whose arrival gave me a wonderful reason to get this book finished. Finally, and most of all, I thank my wife, Cecilia Martínez Gallardo. In addition to being the sunshine of my life, she also thought about and read so many drafts of every chapter of this book (including these acknowledgments) that she can recite pieces by heart. Her intellectual contributions to the book were enormous, but not even a tiny part of what she does for me and shares with me every day. Tqt.