This portrait of the global debate over patent law and access to essential medicines focuses on public health concerns about HIV/AIDS, malaria, tuberculosis, the SARS virus, influenza and diseases of poverty. The essays explore the diplomatic negotiations and disputes in key international forums, such as the World Trade Organization, the World Health Organization and the World Intellectual Property Organization.

Drawing upon international trade law, innovation policy, intellectual property law, health law, human rights and philosophy, the authors seek to canvass policy solutions that encourage and reward worthwhile pharmaceutical innovation while ensuring affordable access to advanced medicines. A number of creative policy options are critically assessed, including the development of a Health Impact Fund, prizes for medical innovation, the use of patent pools, Open Source drug development and forms of ‘creative capitalism’.

**Thomas Pogge** is Leitner Professor of Philosophy and International Affairs at Yale University, Professorial Fellow at the ANU Centre for Applied Philosophy and Public Ethics (CAPPE), Research Director at the Oslo University Centre for the Study of Mind in Nature (CSMN) and Adjunct Professor at the University of Central Lancashire.

**Matthew Rimmer** is a senior lecturer and Associate Director of Research at the ANU College of Law, and Associate Director of the Australian Centre for Intellectual Property in Agriculture.

**Kim Rubenstein** is Professor and Director of the Centre for International and Public Law (CIPL) at the ANU College of Law, Australian National University.
CONNECTING INTERNATIONAL LAW
WITH PUBLIC LAW

This series of books flows from workshops bringing public and international lawyers and public and international policy makers together for interdisciplinary discussion on selected topics and themes. It aims to broaden both public and international laws’ understanding of how these two areas intersect. Until now, international and public law have mainly overlapped in discussions on how international law is implemented domestically. This series is unique in consciously bringing together public and international lawyers to consider and engage in each other’s scholarship.

Series Editors
Professor Kim Rubenstein, Australian National University
Professor Thomas Pogge, Yale University

Books in the series
Incentives for Global Public Health: Patent Law and Access to Essential Medicines
Edited by Thomas Pogge, Matthew Rimmer and Kim Rubenstein
Sanctions, Accountability and Governance in a Globalised World
Edited by Jeremy Farrall and Kim Rubenstein
INCENTIVES FOR GLOBAL
PUBLIC HEALTH

Patent Law and Access to Essential Medicines

Edited by

THOMAS POGGE,

MATTHEW RIMMER

and

KIM RUBENSTEIN
CONTENTS

Contributors viii
Series Editors’ Preface xvii
Editors’ Preface xix

Introduction: Access to essential medicines: public health and international law 1
THOMAS POGGE, MATTHEW RIMMER AND KIM RUBENSTEIN

PART I International trade 33
1. TRIPS and essential medicines: must one size fit all? Making the WTO responsive to the global health crisis 35
ROCHELLE C. DREYFUSS
2. The TRIPS Waiver as a recognition of public health concerns in the WTO 56
ANDREW D. MITCHELL AND TANIA VOON
3. Public law challenges to the regulation of pharmaceutical patents in the US bilateral free trade agreements 77
HITOSHI NASU
4. Global health and development: patents and public interest 101
ELIZABETH SIEW-KUAN NG
PART II Innovation 133

5. The Health Impact Fund: better pharmaceutical innovations at much lower prices 135
THOMAS POGGE

6. The Health Impact Fund: a critique 155
KATHLEEN LIDDELL

7. A prize system as a partial solution to the health crisis in the developing world 181
WILLIAM W. FISHER AND TALHA SYED

THOMAS FAUNCE

PART III Intellectual property 233

9. Opening the dam: patent pools, innovation and access to essential medicines 235
DIANNE NICOL AND JANE NIELSEN

10. Open Source drug discovery: a revolutionary paradigm or a Utopian model? 263
KRISHNA RAVI SRINIVAS

11. Accessing and benefit sharing avian influenza viruses through the World Health Organization: a CBD and TRIPS compromise thanks to Indonesia’s sovereignty claim? 284
CHARLES LAWSON AND BARBARA ANN HOCKING

12. The Lazarus Effect: the (RED) Campaign and creative capitalism 313
MATTHEW RIMMER

PART IV Healthcare 341

13. Beyond TRIPS: the role of non-state actors and access to essential medicines 343
NOAH BENJAMIN NOVOGRODSKY
14. Securing health through rights  357  
  KATHARINE G. YOUNG

15. The role of national laws in reconciling constitutional right to health with TRIPS obligations: an examination of the Glivec patent case in India  381  
  RAJSHREE CHANDRA

16. Tipping point: Thai compulsory licences redefine essential medicines debate  406  
  JONATHAN BURTON-MACLEOD

Bibliography  425
Index  486
CONTRIBUTORS

Editors

Having received his PhD in philosophy from Harvard University, PROFESSOR THOMAS POGGE is Leitner Professor of Philosophy and International Affairs at Yale University, Professorial Fellow at the ANU Centre for Applied Philosophy and Public Ethics (CAPPE), Research Director at the Oslo University Centre for the Study of Mind in Nature (CSMN) and Adjunct Professor at the University of Central Lancashire. He is Editor for Social and Political Philosophy for the Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy and a member of the Norwegian Academy of Science. With support from the Australian Research Council, the BUPA Foundation and the European Commission, he currently heads a team effort towards developing a complement to the pharmaceutical patent regime that would improve access to advanced medicines for the poor worldwide. His recent publications include World Poverty and Human Rights, 2nd edn. 2008; Global Justice and Global Ethics, both 2008; and John Rawls: His Life and Theory of Justice and Freedom from Poverty as a Human Right, both 2007.

DR MATTHEW RIMMER is a senior lecturer and Associate Director of Research at the ANU College of Law, and Associate Director of the Australian Centre for Intellectual Property in Agriculture. He holds a BA (Hons) and a University Medal in literature, and an LLB (Hons) from the Australian National University. Dr Rimmer received a PhD in law from the University of New South Wales for his dissertation on The Pirate Bazaar: The Social Life of Copyright Law. He is a member of the ANU Climate Change Institute and a director of the Australian Digital Alliance. Dr Rimmer is the author of Digital Copyright and the Consumer Revolution: Hands off my iPod (2007) and Intellectual Property and Biotechnology: Biological Inventions (2008). He edited the

**Professor Kim Rubenstein** is Professor and Director of the Centre for International and Public Law (CIPL) at the ANU College of Law, Australian National University. A graduate of the University of Melbourne and Harvard University, Professor Rubenstein’s current research projects are at the cutting edge of the intersection between public and international law. Her public law work spans constitutional and administrative law, and also includes her expertise in citizenship law. Her international law work focuses on the status of nationality. Her book, *Australian Citizenship Law in Context* (2002) represents the foundation of her continued scholarly work, looking at the disjuncture between the exclusive legal notion and the more inclusive normative understanding of citizenship.

**Other Contributors**

**Jonathan Burton-MacLeod** holds a BSc from Harvard University, a law degree from Queen’s University, Canada, and a Masters in Law from Harvard Law School. Burton-MacLeod’s initial focus was biochemistry and he worked at the Centers for Disease Control, Atlanta. In law school, his focus remained on international health, with study conducted at the University of Cape Town Faculty of Law. His graduate law degree focused on theories of law and society in the globalization of law, viewed through the lens of public health. Since finishing, much of Burton-MacLeod’s research has focused on American and comparative Constitutional law. He was a lecturer at the ANU College of Law. Burton-MacLeod is currently an Assistant Professor and Assistant Dean (Research) at Jindal Global Law School and Assistant Director at the Centre for Global Governance and Policy.

**Rajshree Chandra** is a Senior Lecturer at Janki Devi Memorial College, Delhi University with fifteen years’ teaching experience in the
Department of Political Science. She has completed a Masters and MPhil from the Centre for Political Studies, Jawaharlal Nehru University (JNU) (New Delhi), and her Doctorate is from the Centre for the Study of Law and Governance (JNU). Her doctoral dissertation is an inquiry into the moral premises of intellectual property rights, as encompassed by the TRIPS regime. Her research interests concern the impact of patent rights on healthcare.

**Professor Rochelle C. Dreyfuss** is the Pauline Newman Professor of Law at New York University School of Law. She holds BA (Wellesley College) and MS (University of California) degrees in Chemistry and a law degree (Columbia Law School), and she clerked for Chief Judge Wilfred Feinberg of the US Court of Appeals for the Second Circuit and Chief Justice Warren E. Burger of the US Supreme Court. She is a member of the National Academy of Sciences (NAS) Committee on Science, Technology and the Law and the National Institute of Health’s Advisory Committee on Genetics, Health and Society, as well as the American Law Institute, where she was Co-reporter for its Project on Intellectual Property: Principles Governing Jurisdiction, Choice of Law, and Judgments in Transnational Disputes. She is a past consultant to the Federal Courts Study Committee, the Presidential Commission on Catastrophic Nuclear Accidents and the Federal Trade Commission. She was also a member of NAS Committees on Intellectual Property in Genomic and Protein Research and Innovation and Intellectual Property Rights in the Knowledge-Based Economy.

**Associate Professor Thomas Faunce** (BA/LLB (Hons), BMed, PhD) has a joint position in the ANU College of Law and Medical School at ANU. He has directed two three-year ARC research projects on (1) the impact of international trade agreements on Australian medicines policy and (2) regulation of nanomedicine in Australia. He has been a consultant for UNESCO on its global ethics and health law database and published widely in this field. His latest book is *Who Owns our Health? Medical Professionalism, Law and Leadership beyond the Age of the Market State* (2007).

**Professor William Fisher** received his undergraduate degree (in American Studies) from Amherst College and his graduate degrees (JD and PhD in the History of American Civilization) from Harvard
University. Between 1982 and 1984, he served as a law clerk to Judge Harry T. Edwards of the US Court of Appeals for the DC Circuit and then to Justice Thurgood Marshall of the US Supreme Court. Since 1984, he has taught at Harvard Law School, where he is currently the Hale and Dorr Professor of Intellectual Property Law and the Director of the Berkman Center for Internet and Society. His academic honours include a Danforth postbaccalaureate fellowship (1978–82) and a postdoctoral fellowship at the Center for Advanced Study in the Behavioral Sciences in Stanford, California (1992–3).

**ASSOCIATE PROFESSOR BARBARA ANN HOCKING** is an academic at QUT Faculty of Law. She has been a visitor at the Faculty of Law at the University of Tasmania for two years. She is the editor of *Towards a Nexus of Law and Biology: New Ethical Challenges* (2009) and was recently awarded an Australian Linkage International Fellowship (ARClF) to work on intersections between avian influenza planning and human rights. She is currently preparing a second edition of her book *Liability for Negligent Words* (1999) with Scott Guy.

**DR CHARLES LAWSON** is a senior research fellow with ACIPA and an associate professor at the Griffith Law School at Griffith University. Dr Lawson’s research interests include some aspects of intellectual property, competition, trade, access, taxation, public and administrative law and risk assessment and management.

**DR KATHLEEN LIDDELL** (DPhil (Oxon), LLB (Hons), BSc (Melb), MBioethics (Monash)) is the Herchel Smith Lecturer in Intellectual Property Law at Cambridge University and a fellow of Downing College. Her research focuses on the legal and ethical frameworks surrounding medical research, biotechnology and bioinformation. Her research benefits from funding provided by the Wellcome Trust, the Cambridge Genetics Knowledge Park and the Sasakawa Peace Foundation. It forms part of a programme of investigations organized by the Centre for Intellectual Property and Information Law and the Cambridge Centre for Medical Genetics and Policy.

**DR ANDREW MITCHELL** is an Associate Professor at Melbourne Law School. He has studied law at the University of Melbourne, Harvard Law School and Cambridge University. In addition to his Melbourne teaching, Dr Mitchell has taught WTO law to undergraduate and
postgraduate students at Bond University, Monash University and the University of Western Ontario, and to Australian and overseas government officials at the Australian Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade and the International Development Law Organization respectively. His monograph *Legal Principles in WTO Disputes* was published in 2008.

**Dr Hitoshi Nasu** joined the ANU College of Law in December 2006. Prior to his appointment to the ANU, he was a part-time lecturer at the University of Sydney, teaching international law. He completed a PhD in 2006 by submitting a doctoral thesis entitled *Precautionary Approach to International Security Law: A Study of Article 40 of the UN Charter*.

**Associate Professor Elizabeth Siew-Kuan Ng** has been teaching intellectual property law at the Faculty of Law, National University of Singapore since 1986. She is the author of several books and has published widely and delivered papers at numerous international conferences on intellectual property law. She was a consultant to the World Intellectual Property Organization (‘WIPO’), Switzerland; a visiting scholar to the US Court of Appeal for the Federal Circuit, Washington DC; and tutor in IP law of the WIPO Worldwide Academy, Switzerland. She served on many national and international projects to advise on intellectual property laws. Professor Ng regularly gives opinions on intellectual property law to clients in the public and private sectors. She holds an LLB (Hons) from the University of London and an LLM (First Class) from the University of Cambridge. She was awarded the Sweet & Maxwell Law Prize (1981) and the Faculty of Law prize (1983) from the University of London and the Clough prize (1984) from the University of Cambridge. She is also a barrister-at-law of the Middle Temple, England, an advocate and solicitor of the Supreme Court of Singapore, a fellow of the Cambridge Commonwealth Society, University of Cambridge and Team Leader (Information Communication Technology section) of the East Asian International Economic Law and Policy ICT Research Network of the University of Hong Kong.

**Professor Dianne Nicol** is a professor in the Law Faculty at the University of Tasmania and a deputy director of the Centre for Law and Genetics (CLG), a cross-institutional research group based at the
University of Tasmania and Melbourne University. She teaches in the areas of intellectual property law, equity, media law, IT law and biotechnology and the law. She is Associate Dean for Research in the Law Faculty and Graduate Research Co-ordinator. She is also Chair of the University Animal Ethics Committee. Her research focuses on intellectual property issues in health and biotechnology, particularly on use of patented inventions.

Dr Jane Nielsen is a lecturer in law at the Law Faculty, University of Tasmania. Dr Nielsen’s primary research interests concern the intersection of intellectual property and competition law, particularly as these issues pertain to the medical biotechnology industry. Dr Nielsen completed her PhD thesis in this area and has published a number of related papers. She also has an interest in the issue of compulsory licensing and its role in ensuring access to technologies. Her current project is to consider the role of patent pooling in facilitating access to, and distribution of, key biotechnology research tools and technologies.

Professor Noah Novogrodsky is an associate professor at the University of Wyoming law school and the former head of the International Human Rights Program at the University of Toronto Faculty of Law. Professor Novogrodsky has been a visiting professor at Georgetown University Law Center and a Schell fellow at Yale Law School. Professor Novogrodsky holds a BA degree from Swarthmore College (Political Science and English Literature), an MPhil Degree in International Relations from Cambridge University and a Juris Doctor from Yale Law School. Professor Novogrodsky’s current research agenda focuses on the impact of AIDS treatment on the field of human rights law.

Dr Krishna Ravi Srinivas is an associate fellow with RIS researching intellectual property rights and trade and environment issues. He holds a PhD from National Law School University, Bangalore. He has been a visiting scholar on a Fulbright Fellowship at the Law School, University of Pennsylvania, a visiting scholar at the Law School, Indiana University, Bloomington, a post-doc fellow at the South Centre, Geneva and a member of Visiting Faculty at IIM-Bangalore. His articles have been published in, *inter alia,*
Talha Syed is an Assistant Professor at the University of California, Berkeley Law School, where he teaches and researches on intellectual property (with a focus on patents), torts, health law and legal theory. He has a BA (Hons) from the University of Western Ontario, an LLB (gold medallist) from the University of Victoria and is an SJD (doctoral) candidate at Harvard University. His academic honours include an Academic Fellowship from the Petrie-Flom Center for Health Law Policy, Biotechnology and Bioethics at Harvard Law School, research awards from the Weatherhead Center for Justice, Welfare and Economics at Harvard University and the Social Science and Humanities Research Council of Canada, and several Certificates for Distinction in Teaching from Harvard College.

Dr Tania Voon is an associate professor at Melbourne Law School and a former legal officer of the Appellate Body Secretariat of the World Trade Organization (‘WTO’). She has previously practised law with Mallesons Stephen Jaques and the Australian Government Solicitor and taught law at Monash University, Bond University and the University of Western Ontario. She completed her PhD at the University of Cambridge and her LLM at Harvard Law School. Her book, Cultural Products and the World Trade Organization, was published in 2007.

Katharine Young is a research fellow at the Regulatory Institutions Network at ANU. She earned her BA and LLB (Hons) from the University of Melbourne and an LLM at Harvard Law School. She was an SJD candidate at Harvard Law School where she held a graduate fellowship at the Edmond J. Safra Foundation Center for Ethics. She has served as Consultant Scholar at the NYU School of Law’s Center for Human Rights and Global Justice, as Assistant to the Project Director of Health Rights and Ghana’s Poor for Harvard Law School and the Fulbright Foundation, and as a graduate fellow at Harvard University’s Project on Justice, Welfare and Economics. In 2001, she was Associate
to Justice Michael Kirby in the High Court of Australia. Her current fields of research include comparative constitutional law, law and development, law and economics, and international human rights. Her scholarly publications include ‘The Minimum Core of Economic and Social Rights: A Concept in Search of Content’ in the *Yale Journal of International Law* (2008).
The idea for this series began in June 2005 when Kim Rubenstein applied for the position of Professor and Director of the Centre for International and Public Law at the ANU College of Law. The Centre is recognized as the leading Australian academic centre bringing together public lawyers (constitutional and administrative law broadly, but also specific areas of government regulation) and international lawyers from around the world. Established in 1990 with its inaugural director Professor Philip Alston, the impact of the Centre and its work can be seen further at law.anu.edu.au/cipl/.

In discussing with the law faculty ideas for the Centre’s direction, Kim raised the concept that underpins this series. Each volume flows from workshops bringing public and international lawyers and public and international policy makers together for interdisciplinary discussion on selected topics and themes. The workshops attract both established scholars and outstanding early scholars. At each of the workshops participants address specific questions and issues, developing each other’s understandings and knowledge about public and international law and policy and the links between the disciplines as they intersect with the chosen subject. These papers are discussed and reviewed at the workshop collaboratively. After the workshop the papers are finalized for the editing phase for the overall manuscript.

The series seeks to broaden both public law and international laws’ understanding of how these two areas intersect. Until now, international and public law have mainly overlapped in discussions on how international law is implemented domestically. While there is scholarship developing in the area of global administrative law, and some scholars have touched upon the principles relevant to both disciplines, the publications to date contain only a subset of the concept underpinning this series. This series is unique in consciously bringing together public and international lawyers to consider and engage in each other’s scholarship.
Beyond the first topic of sanctions, the other four topics in the series (including this second volume on health), draw from the research themes underpinning the International Alliance of Research Universities (‘IARU’) which is made up of the ANU, Berkeley, University of Cambridge, University of Copenhagen, ETH Zurich, National University of Singapore, Oxford University, Peking University, the University of Tokyo and Yale. The remaining three topics and volumes will be around environment, movement of people and security.

The Alliance has also supported the funding of participants from the IARU in some instances so that they can attend in person at the ANU. This does not preclude non-IARU academics from participating, as will be seen in the rich array of participants in the first two volumes.

After the first successful workshop was complete, Professor Rubenstein contacted Professor Thomas Pogge to co-host the second workshop and, in addition to doing that, he has enthusiastically joined with Professor Rubenstein as a joint series editor. His contributions to each volume are an expression of his cosmopolitan outlook, which is a theme engaged with throughout the series.

Kim Rubenstein
and
Thomas Pogge
June 2009
EDITORS’ PREFACE

As explained in the Series Editors’ Preface, this series is a result of workshops bringing together public and international lawyers. From this second volume onwards, the topics revolve around the International Alliance of Research Universities’ (‘IARU’) thematic research topics.

When Kim Rubensteil began thinking about organizing the second workshop around the theme of health, she was encouraged to contact her ANU colleague Thomas Pogge in the Centre for Applied Philosophy and Public Ethics. Thomas responded enthusiastically and work began to brainstorm the call for papers.

This second workshop was entitled: ‘Incentives for Global Public Health: Patent Law and Access to Essential Medicines.’ This title is inspired by Professor Pogge’s research programme, which explores institutional mechanisms that would create additional incentives to develop essential medicines while also ensuring real access to the resulting new products even for the world’s poorest populations.

This topic provides excellent material for the themes the series is meant to explore. A majority of human beings are endangered by serious diseases for which advanced medicines are either not being developed at all or are inaccessible to them. To explain this huge healthcare deficit, we must study the relevant parts of international and public law together and examine their interplay. To judge these national and international rules – and those who formulate, promulgate and enforce them – we need to relate these rules to internationally recognized human rights and ask, for example, whether it is not a violation of human rights legally to prevent generic manufacturers from supplying essential medicines cheaply to poor patients. To lift, through institutional reforms, the great disease burden from the world’s poor, we need to take a broadly holistic approach that takes advantage of the fact that innovation is cost-free at the margin: the cost of pharmaceutical R&D is the same regardless of whether access to its products is confined to the affluent or extended to
all. The existing regime of national and international intellectual property rules can then be criticized not merely as immoral, but also as irrational insofar as there are great collective benefits to be unlocked through a more efficient system of rules governing pharmaceutical innovation.

Our workshop took place on 26–28 May 2008 at the Australian National University. The twenty paper presenters and a further eleven participants, who had read all the papers, enjoyed vigorous discussion, engaging fully with each other and the material. We thank Professor Simon Bronitt, former Director of ANU’s National Europe Centre, for providing us with a dynamic venue. We thank Chikosa Banda, Clancy Kelly, Dr Luigi Palombi and Antony Taubman for presenting stimulating papers at the workshop even though they were unable to contribute to the resulting book. Dr Kieran Donaghy, Professor Peter Drahos, Associate Professor Anna George, Dr Ian Heath, Dr Janet Hope, Professor Sarah Joseph, Teresa Lawler, Hafiz Aziz ur Rehman, Dr Michael Selgelid, Professor Judy Whitworth and Renata Zanetti either participated in discussions or chaired various sessions and we thank them for their valuable contributions to the workshop. The event was ably organized by the redoubtable Kavitha Robinson.

The call for abstracts was sent out to the Law Deans of the IARU and we thank the respective universities for their support to their participants (in particular Cambridge University for supporting Chikosa Banda’s travel and the National University of Singapore for supporting Elizabeth Siew-Kuan Ng’s travel), and to the ANU, IARU secretariat for its support in covering the IARU participants’ costs at the ANU. This was in addition to other financial support from the ANU, including the Vice Chancellor’s travel fund in supporting Professor Dreyfuss and Professor Novogrodsky’s participation and the remaining expenses which were split evenly between the Centre for International and Public Law and the Centre for Applied Philosophy and Public Ethics.

We are also grateful to Teresa Lawler, who was a CIPL intern at the time of the workshop and continued to help us develop the resulting papers. Special thanks are due to Trevor Moses for the effort he has put in for both volumes in the series, providing outstanding support, particularly in the final stages of bringing the entire volume together. We thank him immensely! We also thank Jennifer Braid from the ANU College of Law for her assistance in the early stages of putting this volume together, before she moved from the ANU to work at the High Court of Australia. Matthew Peterson also provided sterling research assistance. Kim and
Thomas thank their co-editor Matthew for doing the lion’s share of the
day-to-day managing of the project.

And all three of us thank the staff at Cambridge University Press, and
especially Finola O’Sullivan for her enthusiasm in getting this volume
and series off the ground. We are grateful for Kate Ollerenshaw’s impec-
cable copy-editing.

Finally, we would like to thank our colleagues at the ANU College of
Law and the Centre for Applied Philosophy and Public Ethics and our
respective families and friends for their support and inspiration in all
that we do.

Thomas Pogge,
Matthew Rimmer
and
Kim Rubenstein
June 2009