Using a methodology that both analyses particular constitutional texts and theories and reconstructs their historical evolution, Chris Thornhill examines the social role and legitimating status of constitutions from the first quasi-constitutional documents of medieval Europe, through the classical period of revolutionary constitutionalism, to recent processes of constitutional transition. *A Sociology of Constitutions* explores the reasons why modern societies require constitutions and constitutional norms, and presents a distinctive socio-normative analysis of the constitutional preconditions of political legitimacy.

**Chris Thornhill** is Professor of European Political Thought and Head of Politics at the University of Glasgow, where his research focuses both on the relations between legal and political theory and legal and political sociology and on processes of state formation and constitution writing in different European societies.
Cambridge Studies in Law and Society aims to publish the best scholarly work on legal discourse and practice in its social and institutional contexts, combining theoretical insights and empirical research.

The fields that it covers are: studies of law in action; the sociology of law; the anthropology of law; cultural studies of law, including the role of legal discourses in social formations; law and economics; law and politics; and studies of governance. The books consider all forms of legal discourse across societies, rather than being limited to lawyers' discourses alone.

The series editors come from a range of disciplines: academic law, socio-legal studies, sociology, and anthropology. All have been actively involved in teaching and writing about law in context.

Series editors

Chris Arup Monash University, Victoria
Martin Chanock La Trobe University, Melbourne
Pat O’Malley University of Sydney
Sally Engle Merry New York University
Susan Silbey Massachusetts Institute of Technology

Books in the series

Diseases of the Will
Mariana Valverde

The Politics of Truth and Reconciliation in South Africa: Legitimizing the Post-apartheid State
Richard A. Wilson

Modernism and the Grounds of Law
Peter Fitzpatrick

Unemployment and Government: Genealogies of the Social
William Walters

Autonomy and Ethnicity: Negotiating Competing Claims in Multi-ethnic States
Yash Ghai

Constituting Democracy: Law, Globalism and South Africa’s Political Reconstruction
Heinz Klug

The Ritual of Rights in Japan: Law, Society, and Health Policy
Eric A. Feldman

The Invention of the Passport: Surveillance, Citizenship and the State
John Torpey

Governing Morals: A Social History of Moral Regulation
Alan Hunt
Justice and Reconciliation in Post-Apartheid South Africa
Edited by François du Bois and Antje du Bois-Pedain
Militarization and Violence against Women in Conflict Zones in the Middle East: A Palestinian Case Study
Nadera Shalhoub-Kevorkian
Child Pornography and Sexual Grooming: Legal and Societal Responses
Suzanne Ost
Darfur and the Crime of Genocide
John Hagan and Wenona Rymond-Richmond
Planted Flags: Trees, Land, and Law in Israel/Palestine
Irus Braverman
Fictions of Justice: The International Criminal Court and the Challenge of Legal Pluralism in Sub-Saharan Africa
Kamari Maxine Clarke
Conducting Law and Society Research: Reflections on Methods and Practices
Simon Halliday and Patrick Schmidt
Culture under Cross-Examination: International Justice and the Special Court for Sierra Leone
Tim Kelsall
The Gacaca Courts and Post-genocide Justice and Reconciliation in Rwanda: Justice without Lawyers
Phil Clark
Water on Tap: Rights and Regulation in the Transnational Governance of Urban Water Services
Bronwen Morgan
A Sociology of Constitutions: Constitutions and State Legitimacy in Historical-Sociological Perspective
Chris Thornhill
A SOCIOLOGY OF CONSTITUTIONS

Constitutions and State Legitimacy in Historical-Sociological Perspective

CHRIS THORNHILL
For Grace and John
# CONTENTS

**Acknowledgements**  page xi

**A note on texts and translations**  xiii

**Introduction**  1

- Why a sociology of constitutions?  1
- What is a constitution?  8
- A note on method and central concepts  12

1  **Medieval constitutions**  20

- The social origins of modern constitutions  20
- Legal order in the church  25
- Church law, the state and feudal transformation  32
- Patterns of early statehood  40
- Constitutions and the formation of early states  55
- Early states and constitutions  61

2  **Constitutions and early modernity**  77

- Constitutions and the rule of law at the end of the Middle Ages  77
- The Reformation and the differentiation of state power  88
- Positive law and the idea of the constitution  96
- Constitutions and fundamental law  103
- Early modern constitutional conflicts  110
- The constitution and the function of constitutional rights  153
## CONTENTS

### 3 States, rights and the revolutionary form of power

- Constitutional crisis and failed state formation: 158
- Constitutional revolutions and the form of political power: 168
- After the rights revolutions I: the Bonapartist temptation: 181
- After the rights revolutions II: monarchy limited and intensified: 219
- Constitutions and social design: 1848: 228

### 4 Constitutions from empire to fascism

- Constitutions after 1848: 252
- Constitutions in the imperial era: 257
- The First World War and the tragedy of the modern state: 275
- The failure of expansive democracy: 293
- Rights and the Constitution of Fascism: 310

### 5 Constitutions and democratic transitions

- The first wave of transition: constitutional re-foundation after 1945: 327
- The second wave of transition: constitutional re-foundation in the 1970s: 341
- The third wave of transition: constitutional transformation in the 1990s: 355

- Conclusion: 372

- Bibliography: 377
- Index: 425
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

While writing this book I found myself in the company of a number of brilliant scholars, academics and intellectuals who either shaped my thinking in a general manner or offered advice or stimulation on particular points of fact and interpretation. In particular, I would like to mention Samantha Ashenden, Hauke Brunkhorst, Jean Clam, Emilios Christodoulidis, Daniel Chernilo, Photini Danou, Robert Fine, Poul Kjaer, Mikael Rask Madsen, William Outhwaite, Inger-Johanne Sand, Darrow Schecter, Irene Stolzi, Gunther Teubner, Adam Tomkins, Johan van der Walt and Stephen White. Most especially, however, I would like to thank Chris Berry and Gianfranco Poggi, who exceeded all normal bounds of collegiality in reading long sections of the book in its earlier stages and offering very helpful comments and suggestions. Of course, I do not expect that any of these people will agree with what I have written here, but (for better or for worse) I would not have written it without my intellectual exchanges with them. I would also like very warmly to thank Finola O’Sullivan at Cambridge University Press for encouraging me throughout this project.

Vital to the writing of this book were two research trips to the Max-Planck-Institut für Europäische Rechtsgeschichte in Frankfurt am Main. I found the Institute a magnificent place to work, and I am grateful to all its employees, albeit most especially to Frau Ursula Pohl, for their assistance in finding books and manuscripts for me during my sojourns there. I owe a similar debt of gratitude to the staff in the Rare Books Room at the British Library and in the Special Collections Library at the University of Glasgow.

In addition, I would like to express my gratitude to my students in politics at Glasgow University, in particular to those who have taken my courses on the history of political thought, fascism, and political legitimacy, for the fact that they have so consistently and intelligently challenged my preconceptions and forced me to consider and reflect...
on my ideas in new ways. I have found it a great privilege over the last five years to teach the young men and women studying in Glasgow, and much of my work has been thought out – either immediately or through more indirect engagement – in the company of students at Glasgow.
A NOTE ON TEXTS AND TRANSLATIONS

This book examines texts written originally in a number of languages, spanning many centuries, some of which have been translated into English and some of which have not. To guarantee some degree of uniformity in referencing, I have decided to refer to all works in original editions, and all translations of these editions are my own. I accept all responsibility for whatever shortcomings these translations might have.