

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-11549-0 - Galen on Problematical Movements Edited with Introduction  
and Commentary

Vivian Nutton

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

CAMBRIDGE CLASSICAL TEXTS  
AND COMMENTARIES

EDITORS

J. DIGGLE   N. HOPKINSON   S.P. OAKLEY  
J. G. F. POWELL   M. D. REEVE   D. N. SEDLEY  
R. J. TARRANT

47

GALEN: ON PROBLEMATICAL  
MOVEMENTS

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-11549-0 - Galen on Problematical Movements Edited with Introduction  
and Commentary

Vivian Nutton

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-11549-0 - Galen on Problematical Movements Edited with Introduction  
and Commentary

Vivian Nutton

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

# GALEN

## ON PROBLEMATICAL MOVEMENTS

EDITED WITH INTRODUCTION  
AND COMMENTARY

BY

VIVIAN NUTTON

*Professor Emeritus of the History of Medicine  
University College London*

WITH AN EDITION OF THE ARABIC  
VERSION

BY

GERRIT BOS

*Professor, Chair for Jewish Studies at the  
Martin Buber Institut für Judaistik  
Universität zu Köln*



CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-11549-0 - Galen on Problematical Movements Edited with Introduction and Commentary

Vivian Nutton

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore,  
São Paulo, Delhi, Tokyo, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press  
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by  
Cambridge University Press, New York

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9780521115490](http://www.cambridge.org/9780521115490)

This edition © Vivian Nutton 2011

Arabic text © Gerrit Bos 2011

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception  
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,  
no reproduction of any part may take place without the written  
permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2011

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library*

*Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data*  
Galen.

Galen on problematical movements / edited with introduction and commentary by  
Vivian Nutton ; with an edition of the Arabic version by Gerrit Bos.

p. ; cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-0-521-11549-0 (hardback)

1. Kinesiology--Early works to 1800. 2. Human mechanics--Early works to  
1800. 3. Human anatomy--Early works to 1800. 4. Medicine, Medieval.

I. Nutton, Vivian. II. Title.

[DNLM: 1. Movement. 2. Anatomy. 3. Greek World. 4. History, Ancient.  
WZ 294]

QP303.G25 2011

612.7'6--dc23 2011009030

ISBN 978-0-521-11549-0 Hardback

---

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or  
accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in  
this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will  
remain, accurate or appropriate.

---

CONTENTS

<i>Acknowledgments</i>	<i>page vii</i>
INTRODUCTION	
I The treatise	i
Authenticity	4
Date	6
Galen’s anatomical reasoning	10
II The textual traditions	18
Greek	19
The Oriental tradition [G.B.]	20
Niccolò da Reggio	25
Mark of Toledo	27
The manuscripts	30
A preliminary classification	46
The α family	51
The β family	54
Author’s or redactor’s variants?	66
Editions	77
Styles of translation	81
Niccolò da Reggio	81
Ḥunayn ibn Ishāq [G.B.]	85
Mark of Toledo	87
III Mark’s version and medieval medicine	90
<i>De motibus</i> and the ‘New Galen’	91
Reading <i>De motibus</i> at a medieval university	100
<i>De motibus</i> and medieval anatomy	106
IV Texts, English translation, and commentary:	
general principles of this edition	112
TEXTS AND TRANSLATION	
Sigla	120
De motibus dubiis/On problematical movements	122
Ḥunayn’s Arabic version/De motibus liquidis	178

Cambridge University Press  
978-0-521-11549-0 - Galen on Problematical Movements Edited with Introduction  
and Commentary  
Vivian Nutton  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

CONTENTS

COMMENTARY	251
REFERENCES	
I Abbreviations	375
II Bibliography	375
1 Editions and translations of Galen	375
2 Secondary literature	377
INDEX	
General Index	394
Index Fontium	397

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-11549-0 - Galen on Problematical Movements Edited with Introduction and Commentary

Vivian Nutton

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

When I first contemplated an edition of *DMD* I had little idea of the extent to which I would be breaking new ground, although I was aware that basic information on this text, so long considered spurious, and on its place in the history of Galenism was scanty and often misleading. A naive expectation that Mark's version would be of relatively little interest or value compared with those of his fellow translators soon disappeared, as did my understanding from earlier catalogues and repertories that the number of MSS that it would be necessary to collate would be small. The librarians and staff of the institutions housing the MSS discussed in this edition have been unfailingly helpful, some, most notably at Cesena and Basle, going well beyond what I could have expected. Anette Löffler provided me with detailed information on the context of **Li**. Hormoz Ebrahimnejad and Brigitte Mondrain smoothed my path to obtaining photographs of the MSS in Wrocław and on Mt Athos. Michael McVaugh and Anne-Marie Turcan-Verkerk located photographs of the lost Chartres MS for me, while Diethard Nickel supplied me with a print of the Dresden MS from the CMG archives. Caroline Petit and Candice Delisle checked readings in the Vatican and Montpellier MSS of which I was uncertain.

I have been shameless in seeking the help of expert palaeographers in tracing the history of many MSS, and I have learned a great deal from their instruction. Tiziana Pesenti discussed the Vatican MSS at length with me, and checked many of my decipherments of their marginalia. Danielle Jacquart shared with me the results of her and her students' investigations into the medical MSS in Paris, as well as providing me with the clue to the context for Mark's double translation. Michael Reeve was a welcome source of bibliographical information, and a stern but fair critic of my enthusiasms. Scot McKendrick and Christiane Van den Bergen-Pantens helped identify the owner of **D**. Some way along my codicological odyssey I discovered

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-11549-0 - Galen on Problematical Movements Edited with Introduction and Commentary

Vivian Nutton

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

that a Finnish group of scholars, led by Outi Merisalo and Päivi Pahta, were carrying out a very detailed examination of all the MSS of the pseudo-Galenic *De spermate*, and that we were working on many of the same codices. Outi Merisalo's palaeographical researches are more detailed than mine, and I am grateful to her for sharing their preliminary results with me. Our cooperation has, I hope, benefited both projects.

My debt to other friends, colleagues, and distant correspondents is substantial. Rarely did a query go unanswered, and often replies led me down paths to yet more discoveries. The pleasure of cooperative scholarship is a rare privilege that I have enjoyed more than my importunings deserved.

My largest debt is to Gerrit Bos, who kindly agreed to prepare the Arabic text and who patiently over several days went through with me all the passages in the two redactions of Mark's version where divergent readings might depend on the underlying Arabic. My questions via email were answered almost instantaneously, and his long familiarity with both Arabic and Hebrew, and their medieval Latin descendants, saved me from many mistakes. He also kindly provided me with an English translation of the Arabic, which forms the basis for many of the translations from the Arabic which can be found in the commentary, especially when this version differs from that of Mark. My London colleague Nicolai Serikoff was, as always, willing to help me with knotty problems of Arabic style and syntax, as well as discuss with me over lunch abstruse problems in the transmission of classical medical and scientific literature. Over many years Gotthard Strohmaier has taught me much about the Arabic tradition of Galenism. Klaus-Dietrich Fischer and Ivan Garofalo read preliminary drafts of the Latin versions and made many valuable suggestions, while Elizabeth Craik improved my English translation. Barbara Zipser not only discussed many philological points with me but also instructed me in the mysteries of TeXnicCenter, saving me on innumerable occasions from the inadequacies of my computing skills when using an editing programme devised by Dominic Wujastyk.



Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-11549-0 - Galen on Problematical Movements Edited with Introduction and Commentary

Vivian Nutton

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

My speculations on the place of *DMD* in medieval medical education were subjected to vigorous criticism from Charles Burnett, Joan Cadden, Floriano Cesar, Geneviève Dumas, Peter Jones, Michael McVaugh, Cornelius O'Boyle, Katherine Park, Nancy Siraisi, and Faith Wallis, while a probing question from Eduard Seidler led me to look more closely at the marginalia. Luke Demaitre and Fernando Salmón provided me with details of their unpublished transcriptions of Bernard of Gordon and Arnald of Villanova, while Gundolf Keil answered many questions on medieval anatomical terminology. Paul Demont kindly gave me details of the readings of the MSS of the Hippocratic *De humoribus*. My understanding of the ancient background to some of Galen's comments was clarified by Paul Cartledge, Armelle Debru, Bob Sharples, Simon Swain, and Manuela Tecusan. Julius Rocca helped me to make sense of Galen's anatomy and physiology, while John Forrester patiently explained to me the anatomical background to the long discussion of swallowing in the final chapter. The questions of audiences in Birmingham, Dublin, Fermo, Freiburg, London, and Paris helped clarify many points, as well as convincing me of the wider interest of this small treatise. My wife has, as always, cast an acute eye over everything that I have written. Finally, although I have criticised him severely at times, I must thank Carlos Larrain for sending me the offprints of his work that first alerted me to the importance of *DMD*. Only those who have themselves produced an *editio princeps* know the enormous difference between that and working on a text for which the groundwork has already been laid. The errors, omissions, and misrepresentations that remain are entirely my own, and I am conscious that much still remains to be done to explicate properly this fascinating treatise from the past.

My travel to examine many MSS *in situ* has been eased by invitations to lecture or participate in conferences in nearby institutions, for which I wish to thank the Universities of Erlangen, Freiburg, Paris II, and Roma I, the Studio Fermano, the Berlin-Brandenburgische Akademie der

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-11549-0 - Galen on Problematical Movements Edited with Introduction and Commentary

Vivian Nutton

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Wissenschaften, the Fachverband Medizingeschichte e. V., and the Associazione Nuova Civiltà delle Macchine. I wish also to thank the Wellcome Trust, which has supported my researches over forty years, either directly or through the Wellcome Institute and its successor, the Wellcome Centre for the History of Medicine at UCL.

I have been privileged to know and work with many of the distinguished scholars whose names appear in the bibliography, and I have seen the study of Galen expand over forty years from an eccentric interest of a scattered few to a substantial industry. I have learned much from discussion over the years with classicists, medievalists, renaissance specialists, and medical practitioners, and many of their conclusions and suggestions have found their way into the commentary. Some of those who have influenced me most are no longer with us, notably Owsei Temkin, Luis García Ballester, and Richard Durling. It was Richard Durling who, during one of his own crises in the late 1960s, took home my preliminary draft of an edition (never published) of Niccolò da Reggio's translation of *De praecognitione*, returning it a few days later with a complete index of the Greek and its Latin equivalents. He, more than anyone else, prepared the groundwork for this edition by his own example and by the enormous labours he performed in examining MSS, mainly on the basis of microfilms now held in the National Library of Medicine, Bethesda, Md. He would have enjoyed arguing with me over the quality of the translations, and would have rummaged in his files for the obscurest of information on owners and scribes. This edition will serve as a tribute to the memory of an altruistic scholar and librarian who succeeded, in the face of enormous difficulties, in doing much for an author he considered, with some justice, to have been a neglected genius.