Human Rights: Southern Voices

A just international order and a healthy cosmopolitan discipline of law need to include perspectives that take account of the standpoints, interest, concerns and beliefs of non-Western people and traditions. The dominant scholarly and activist discourses about human rights have developed largely without reference to these other viewpoints. Claims about universality sit uneasily with ignorance of other traditions and parochial or ethnocentric tendencies. The object of the book is to make accessible the ideas of four jurists who present distinct ‘Southern’ perspectives on human rights.

William Twining is Quain Professor of Jurisprudence Emeritus of University College London. He has worked extensively in Eastern Africa, the Commonwealth and the United States. Much of his recent work explores the implications of globalisation for law and legal theory. His previous book, General Jurisprudence: Understanding Law from a Global Perspective, is a precursor of Human Rights: Southern Voices.
The Law in Context Series

Editors: William Twining (University College London), Christopher McCrudden (Lincoln College, Oxford), and Bronwen Morgan (University of Bristol).

Since 1970 the Law in Context series has been in the forefront of the movement to broaden the study of law. It has been a vehicle for the publication of innovative scholarly books that treat law and legal phenomena critically in their social, political and economic contexts from a variety of perspectives. The series particularly aims to publish scholarly legal writing that brings fresh perspectives to bear on new and existing areas of law taught in universities. A contextual approach involves treating legal subjects broadly, using materials from other social sciences, and from any other discipline that helps to explain the operation in practice of the subject under discussion. It is hoped that this orientation is at once more stimulating and more realistic than the bare exposition of legal rules. The series includes original books that have a different emphasis from traditional legal textbooks, while maintaining the same high standards of scholarship. They are written primarily for undergraduate and graduate students of law and of other disciplines, but most also appeal to a wider readership. In the past, most books in the series have focused on English law, but recent publications include books on European law, globalisation, transnational legal processes, and comparative law.

Books in the Series
Anderson, Schum & Twining: Analysis of Evidence
Ashworth: Sentencing and Criminal Justice
Barton & Douglas: Law and Parenthood
Bell: French Legal Cultures
Bercusson: European Labour Law
Birkinshaw: European Public Law
Birkinshaw: Freedom of Information: The Law, the Practice and the Ideal
Cane: Atiyah's Accidents, Compensation and the Law
Clarke & Kohler: Property Law: Commentary and Materials
Collins: The Law of Contract
Cranston: Legal Foundations of the Welfare State
Davies: Perspectives on Labour Law
Dembour: Who Believes in Human Rights?: The European Convention in Question
de Sousa Santos: Toward a New Legal Common Sense
Diduck: Law's Families
Elworthy & Holder: Environmental Protection: Text and Materials
Fortin: Children’s Rights and the Developing Law
Glover-Thomas: Reconstructing Mental Health Law and Policy
Human Rights: Southern Voices

Francis Deng, Abdullahi An-Na’im, Yash Ghai, Upendra Baxi

Edited by

WILLIAM TWINING
# Table of Contents

**Acknowledgments** page ix

1. **Introduction**  
   *William Twining*  
   1

2. **Francis Mading Deng**  
   4  
   2.1 Introduction  
   4
   **Readings**  
   9
   2.2 The Cow and the Thing Called “What”: Dinka Cultural Perspectives on Wealth and Poverty  
   9
   2.3 Human rights, universalism and democracy  
   30  
   (a) Traditional institutions and participatory democracy in Africa  
   30
   (b) Globalisation and localisation of democracy in the African context  
   33
   (c) Universalism versus relativism in cultural contextualisation of human rights  
   36
   (d) Cultural constraints on the universality of human rights  
   39
   (e) Dinka moral values and human rights principles  
   42
   2.4 A cultural approach to human rights among the Dinka  
   44
   2.5 Suggestions for further reading  
   52

3. **Abdullahi An-Na’im**  
   53  
   3.1 Introduction  
   53
   **Readings**  
   58
   3.2 Context and methodology: the Second Message of Islam  
   58
   3.3 Shari’a and basic human rights concerns  
   62
   3.4 Cultural legitimation: Towards a cross-cultural approach to defining international standards of human rights: The meaning of cruel, inhuman, or degrading treatment or punishment  
   79
   3.5 Islam and the secular state  
   91  
   (a) Why Muslims need a secular state  
   91
   (b) Islam, Shari’a, and constitutionalism: non-Muslims  
   94
   (c) Audiences  
   96
## Table of Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(d) Inclusive public debate</td>
<td>97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(e) Secularism in context</td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6 Economic, social and cultural rights (ESCR)</td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.7 Suggestions for further reading</td>
<td>102</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. <strong>Yash Ghai</strong></td>
<td>104</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1 Introduction</td>
<td>104</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2 Universalism and relativism: human rights as a framework for</td>
<td>109</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>negotiating interethnic claims</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>109</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(a) Relativism: a critical assessment</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(b) Generalizations from national studies</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3 Understanding human rights in Asia</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4 Quotations</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(a) The Asian values debate</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(b) Confucianism</td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(c) Hong Kong’s Basic Law</td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(d) The nature of economic, social, and cultural rights</td>
<td>152</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(e) The Justiciability of economic, social, and cultural rights</td>
<td>152</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(f) Poverty and human rights</td>
<td>154</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(g) Post-modernism, globalization, and the nation state</td>
<td>155</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5 Suggestions for further reading</td>
<td>156</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. <strong>Upendra Baxi</strong></td>
<td>157</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1 Introduction</td>
<td>157</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2 Voices of suffering and the future of human rights</td>
<td>162</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3 Rights and “development”</td>
<td>204</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(a) “Development”, “terror” and the posthuman world</td>
<td>204</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(b) Gandhi and development</td>
<td>207</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(c) Time and development: The Millennium Development Goals</td>
<td>208</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4 Suggestions for further reading</td>
<td>210</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. <strong>Conclusion</strong></td>
<td>211</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>William Twining</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Bibliography</em></td>
<td>222</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Index</em></td>
<td>231</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Acknowledgments

This book has been in preparation for several years. The project crystallized with an invitation to give the annual MacDonald Lecture at the University of Alberta in 2005. The lecture developed into a long article, from that into a proposal for a book, which became the subject of a Symposium at the Transitional Justice Institute of the University of Ulster in June 2008 that was supported by the British Academy and the University of Ulster. This memorable event was attended by all four of the subjects of this reader. Throughout this period Francis Deng, Abdullahi An-Na’im, Yash Ghai and Upendra Baxi have provided material, submitted to interviews, commented on drafts, and debated with each other in public and private. They have co-operated, while respecting my rights as editor, and they have added the warmth of friendship. I am also grateful for comments and suggestions from participants in seminars and symposia at the Universities of Miami, Alberta, Sussex, Warwick, Ulster (in Belfast and Magee), and University College London. I am especially grateful to Fionnuala Ní Aoláin, Christine Bell, Colm Campbell, and Catherine Turner for their encouragement, help, and hospitality at the Transitional Justice Institute and to the Leverhulme Foundation for an Emeritus Fellowship, which supported several visits to Belfast and the final phases of the editorial process. I owe further debts to Terry Anderson, Pratiksha Baxi, Bill Conklin, Jill Cottrell, Marie-Bénédicte Dembour, Conor Gearty, Oscar Guardiola-Rivera, Andrew Halpin, Christopher McCrudden, Jana Promislow, and Carl Wellman. As ever, my wife, Penelope has provided irreplaceable support and assistance.

The following have kindly given permission for republication of copyright material: The Brookings Institution; Cardozo Law Review; Harvard University Press; Interights; The Journal of International Affairs; Oxford University Press (New Delhi); Review of Constitutional Affairs; Syracuse University Press; Transnational Journal of Law and Contemporary Problems; University of Pennsylvania Press; and Abdullahi An-Na’im, Marie-Bénédicte Dembour, and Yash Ghai. Every attempt has been made to secure permission to reproduce copyright material in this title and grateful acknowledgment is made to the authors and publishers of reproduced material.