

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-11254-3 - Suicide: Foucault, History and Truth

Ian Marsh

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

## Suicide

In an original and provocative study of suicide, Ian Marsh examines the historical and cultural forces that have influenced contemporary thought, practices and policy in relation to this serious public health problem. Drawing on the work of French philosopher Michel Foucault, the book tells the story of how suicide has come to be seen as first and foremost a matter of psychiatric concern. Marsh sets out to challenge the assumptions and certainties embedded in our beliefs, attitudes and practices concerning suicide and the suicidal, and the resulting account unsettles and informs in equal measure. The book will be of particular interest to researchers, professionals and students in psychology, history, sociology and the health sciences.

IAN MARSH is a Senior Lecturer at Canterbury Christ Church University. He previously worked in an NHS Community Mental Health Team and continues to facilitate suicide prevention training.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-11254-3 - Suicide: Foucault, History and Truth

Ian Marsh

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

# Suicide

*Foucault, History and Truth*

---

Ian Marsh

*Canterbury Christ Church University*



CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-11254-3 - Suicide: Foucault, History and Truth

Ian Marsh

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore,  
São Paulo, Delhi

Cambridge University Press

The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press,  
New York

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9780521112543](http://www.cambridge.org/9780521112543)

© Ian Marsh 2010

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception  
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,  
no reproduction of any part may take place without the written  
permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2010

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library*

*Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data*

Marsh, Ian, 1952–

Suicide : Foucault, history and truth / Ian Marsh.

p. cm.

ISBN 978-0-521-11254-3 (hardback)

1. Suicide. 2. Suicide–History. 3. Foucault, Michel, 1926–1984. I. Title.

HV6545.M274 2010

362.28–dc22

2009039348

ISBN 978-0-521-11254-3 Hardback

ISBN 978-0-521-13001-3 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or  
accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet websites referred to in  
this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is,  
or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-11254-3 - Suicide: Foucault, History and Truth

Ian Marsh

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

*For Rosarii, Cara and Connor*

Contents

|   |               |
|---|---------------|
| List of figures   | <i>page</i> x |
| Acknowledgements  | xi            |
| <b>Part I Introduction and analytic strategy</b>  | <b>1</b>      |
| 1 Introduction  | 3             |
| Foucault, critique and the study of suicide   | 3             |
| Rationale   | 5             |
| Plan of the book  | 8             |
| 2 Analytic strategy   | 13            |
| Introduction  | 13            |
| Principles of analysis  | 14            |
| Analytic strategies   | 16            |
| Questions addressed in the book   | 23            |
| <b>Part II The present</b>  | <b>25</b>     |
| 3 Mapping a contemporary ‘regime of truth’ in relation to suicide   | 27            |
| Introduction  | 27            |
| Producing and reproducing truths in relation to suicide: a compulsory ontology of pathology in professional accounts of suicide | 28            |
| Overview: suicide as pathological and a matter of psychiatric concern   | 29            |
| Constructing a compulsory ontology of pathology in relation to suicide  | 31            |
| Achieving authority within texts  | 33            |
| Construction of concepts, objects and subjects  | 36            |
| Disseminating truths in relation to suicide: a compulsory ontology of pathology in media accounts of suicide                    | 43            |
| Media guidelines on the reporting of suicide  | 45            |
| ‘Truth effects’   | 51            |
| Suicide prevention  | 62            |
| Conclusions   | 64            |
|   | vii           |

|      |  |           |
|------|--|-----------|
| viii | Contents   |           |
| 4    | Problematising a contemporary ‘regime of truth’ in relation to suicide   | 65        |
|      | Problematising contemporary discursive formations of suicide   | 65        |
|      | Conclusions  | 75        |
|      | <b>Part III A history of the present</b>   | <b>77</b> |
|      | Introduction to Part III   | 77        |
| 5    | Self-accomplished deaths at other times and in other places: the contingency of contemporary truths in relation to suicide | 79        |
|      | Descriptions of self-accomplished deaths in ancient Greece and Rome  | 79        |
|      | <i>Romana mors</i> : self-accomplished death as relational, philosophical and political                                    | 80        |
|      | Self-accomplished death as a sin and a crime   | 86        |
|      | Conclusions  | 89        |
| 6    | Conditions of possibility for the formation of medical truths of suicide: 1641–1821  | 90        |
|      | Introduction   | 90        |
|      | Inventing suicide  | 90        |
|      | The secularisation of suicide in early modern England  | 92        |
|      | <i>Non compos mentis</i> : suicide and insanity  | 93        |
|      | Alienism, and the asylum as laboratory for the production of medical truths  | 94        |
|      | Accounting for the shift from punishment to confinement and treatment: a new ‘economy’ of power?                           | 96        |
|      | Conclusions  | 99        |
| 7    | Suicide as internal, pathological and medical: Esquirol 1821   | 100       |
|      | Introduction   | 100       |
|      | ‘ <i>Pathologie interne</i> ’  | 100       |
|      | The passions   | 103       |
|      | ‘Suicide provoked by the passions’   | 107       |
|      | Conclusions  | 111       |
| 8    | The production, dissemination and circulation of medical truths in relation to suicide: 1821–1900                          | 115       |
|      | Introduction   | 115       |
|      | Defining suicide by reference to insanity: what sort of madness was suicide?   | 116       |
|      | Suicide as a morbid action of the body, the result of pathological anatomy   | 117       |
|      | Reading the signs written on the body  | 122       |
|      | Suicide arising from an internal, irresistible impulse: possession, perversion and impulsions                              | 124       |
|      | Defining insanity by reference to suicide: what suicide revealed of madness  | 132       |

Cambridge University Press  
 978-0-521-11254-3 - Suicide: Foucault, History and Truth  
 Ian Marsh  
 Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

|  |            |
|--|------------|
| Contents   | ix         |
| Defining psychiatry by reference to suicide: what suicide tells us of the function of psychiatry               | 135        |
| Subject formation  | 143        |
| The changing nature of the suicidal subject  | 149        |
| Responsibility, accountability and culpability in preventing suicide   | 150        |
| <b>9 Managing the problem of the suicidal patient: containment, constant watching and restraint</b>            | <b>156</b> |
| Asylum practices   | 156        |
| Asylum suicides  | 159        |
| Conclusions  | 166        |
| <b>10 Towards the ‘normatively monolithic’ – ‘psy’ discourse and suicide: 1897–1981</b>                        | <b>168</b> |
| The challenge to, and later reassertion of, psychiatric dominance in relation to suicide                       | 168        |
| Extending the possibilities for the ‘pathologisation’ of suicide   | 173        |
| Psychoanalytic constructions of the suicidal subject   | 174        |
| Challenging psychiatric dominance  | 181        |
| Sociological discourse on suicide  | 182        |
| Thomas Szasz on suicide  | 184        |
| Reasserting psychiatric dominance  | 187        |
| Demarcating the normal and pathological in relation to suicide: psychological autopsy, St Louis, 1959 and 1981 | 187        |
| Conclusions  | 191        |
| <b>11 The discursive formation of the suicidal subject: Sarah Kane and <i>4.48 Psychosis</i>, 2000</b>         | <b>193</b> |
| Introduction   | 193        |
| Suicidal subjectivities and first-person accounts  | 194        |
| Sarah Kane, suicide and <i>4.48 Psychosis</i>  | 195        |
| <i>4.48 Psychosis</i> as constituted by ‘pathological’ discourses on suicide                                   | 197        |
| <i>4.48 Psychosis</i> as a critique of, and resistance to, psychiatric discourse and practices                 | 202        |
| <i>4.48 Psychosis</i> as subverting foundational psychiatric assumptions of the self and suicide               | 208        |
| Witnessing a private act   | 210        |
| Conclusions  | 213        |
| <b>Part IV Summary and conclusions</b>   | <b>217</b> |
| <b>12 Summary and conclusions</b>  | <b>219</b> |
| Summary of arguments and findings  | 219        |
| Conclusions  | 223        |
| References   | 231        |
| Index  | 248        |

Figures

---

|   |                 |
|---|-----------------|
| 8.1 Style of thought in Thomas Chevalier’s <i>Remarks on Suicide</i> (1824) | <i>page</i> 118 |
| 8.2 Style of thought in Jean-Etienne Esquirol’s ‘Suicide’ (1821)            | 119             |
| 8.3 ‘Portrait of a female ... in a state of perpetual distress’             | 125             |
| 8.4 ‘Suicidal Melancholy’   | 126             |
| 9.1 Reported suicides in licensed institutions for the insane, 1861–81      | 160             |
| 9.2 Kent County Lunatic Asylum, Chartham, c. 1900                           | 161             |



Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-11254-3 - Suicide: Foucault, History and Truth

Ian Marsh

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## Acknowledgements

---

Many people are owed a very large debt of thanks for their help and support in the writing of this book. At the University of Brighton Gaynor Sadlo and Alec Grant were generous in their support as supervisors during my doctoral studies there, and Ann Moore, Marilia Vasquet-Whittome, Tracey Harrison and Jayne Ingles were all tremendously helpful at the Clinical Research Centre. Jon Wright deserves special mention for his kindness, guidance and support over many years. East Kent Mental Health NHS Trust initially supported the research, and the whole project was inspired by my colleagues and clients from the ten years I worked there. Canterbury Christ Church University supported the research from May 2002, and Kate Springett was instrumental in providing me with sufficient study leave to complete the project. Colleagues at Christ Church have been very supportive and encouraging and I would like to thank in particular Simon Hannaford, Jan Jenson, Julie Taylor, Pat Chung, Doug MacInnes, Angela Wilson, Hilary Bungay, Lee Bolton and Anita Volkert. Rayya Ghul deserves special thanks for not only covering a significant part of my teaching while I was on study leave, but also for her encouragement and inspiration – I feel lucky to have such a generous colleague and friend.

Peter Watts very carefully critiqued the various drafts he has been presented with over the last couple of years and I am very grateful for the help and support he has provided. He has been a wonderfully patient and intelligent mentor (and the phrase ‘compulsory ontology of pathology’ is rightly his). Liz Hoult read through the whole book and her comments helped clarify my thinking and provided many, many useful suggestions. She is another valuable friend and colleague. Tom Osborne and Chris Stevenson were generous examiners of my PhD thesis, as well as being inspirational with their own work. I would also like to thank Timothy Hill for kindly reading and commenting on chapter 5, and for the anonymous reviewers at Cambridge University Press for their helpful suggestions. Heidi Rimke helped enormously (without being aware of it) with the overall organisation and structure of the book as well as with the

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-11254-3 - Suicide: Foucault, History and Truth

Ian Marsh

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

xii      Acknowledgements

development of many ideas. Others have also contributed a great deal (again without their awareness let alone approval) and here the writings of Derek Hook, Nikolas Rose, Judith Butler and Arnold Davidson stand out. All the mistakes and misunderstandings are mine, however.

I would also like to thank Jayne Curran and Athene Lane-Martin from the East Kent Health Promotion Service, and all the participants of the many Understanding and Managing Suicidal Behaviour training days, for their ideas and suggestions but mostly for keeping me ‘grounded’ as to the realities of suicide prevention work (many might say they have not quite succeeded but if true that would be my fault not theirs).

The friendliness and helpfulness of the staff at the East Kent Archives Centre, Whitfield, made the summer I spent trawling through the records of the local County Lunatic Asylum a very enjoyable experience.

At Cambridge University Press commissioning editors John Haslam and Hetty Reid have been as helpful and supportive as I could have hoped.

My parents and sister have always been supportive of me, and I am extremely grateful to them. Finally, my partner Rosarii Harte, and our children Cara and Connor, have had to live with this project for a long time, but have done so with great good grace and humour. I am eternally grateful for their love and support.