FORMAL SEMANTICS OF
NATURAL LANGUAGE
FORMAL SEMANTICS OF NATURAL LANGUAGE

Papers from a colloquium sponsored by the King’s College Research Centre, Cambridge

EDITED BY
EDWARD L. KEENAN
Senior Research Fellow, King’s College, Cambridge
(now Associate Professor, Department of Linguistics, UCLA)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
CAMBRIDGE
LONDON . NEW YORK . MELBOURNE
CONTENTS

Notes on the contributors vii
Acknowledgements xii
Introduction xiii

I QUANTIFICATION IN NATURAL LANGUAGE
Adverbs of quantification DAVID LEWIS 3
Deletion and variable binding BARBARA HALL PARTEE 16
A semantics for superficial and embedded questions in natural language R. D. HULL 35
Sortal quantification J. E. J. ALTHAM and NEIL W. TENNANT 46

II REFERENCE AND CROSS REFERENCE
Deixis as the source of reference JOHN LYONS 61
Referential constraints on lexical items PIETER SEUREN 84
On generics ÖSTEN DAHL 99
Quantifiers, definite descriptions, and reference COLIN BIGGS 112

III INTENSIONAL LOGIC AND SYNTACTIC THEORY
Two theories about adjectives J. A. W. KAMP 123
Partial interpretations FRANZ VON KUTSCHERA 156
Subcategorization of adnominal and adverbal modifiers RENATE BARTSCH 175
Should generative semantics be related to intensional logic? CARL H. HEIDRICH 188
Transformational semantics ARNIM VON STECHOW 205

IV QUESTIONING MODEL THEORETIC SEMANTICS
Model theoretic semantics and natural language NICHOLAS JARDINE 219
Model theory and linguistics TIMOTHY C. POTTS 241
vi Contents

V PRAGMATICS AND SENTENCES IN CONTEXT

Pragmatics in natural logic GEORGE LAKOFF 283
Changing the context STEPHEN ISARD 287
Conditions of the use of sentences and a semantic representation of topic and focus PETR SGALL 297
Topics, sentence accent, ellipsis: a proposal for their formal treatment THEO VENNEMANN 313
Preference semantics YORICK WILKS 329

VI SEMANTICS AND SURFACE SYNTAX

Arguments for assigning tense meanings after certain syntactic transformations apply JOSEPH EMONDS 351
Towards a formal treatment of the phenomenon of aspect CATHERINE FUCHS and JACQUES ROUAULT 373
On the relations between syntax and semantics MAURICE GROSS 389
Logical expressive power and syntactic variation in natural language EDWARD L. KEENAN 406
Clausemateness JOHN R. ROSS 422
NOTES ON THE CONTRIBUTORS

DAVID LEWIS is Professor of Philosophy at Princeton University. He is the author of *Convention* (1969), of *Counterfactuals* (1973), and of articles on metaphysics, semantics, and philosophy of science.

BARBARA HALL PARTEE is Professor of Linguistics and Philosophy at the University of Massachusetts at Amherst. She is co-author with Robert P. Stockwell and Paul Schacher of *The Major Syntactic Structures of English* (1973) and editor of *Montague Grammar* (1975). Her main research interests are syntactic and semantic theory, structure of English, and Montague grammar.


NEIL W. TENNANT is Lecturer in Logic at the University of Edinburgh. His Ph.D. research was on the semantics of knowledge and belief.

J. E. J. ALTHAM is Assistant Lecturer in Philosophy at the University of Cambridge. He is the author of *The Logic of Plurality* (1971). His main research interests are in philosophical logic and in ethics.

JOHN LYONS is Professor of General Linguistics at the University of Edinburgh. He was the first editor of the *Journal of Linguistics* (1965–9); and his publications include *Structural Semantics* (1963), *Introduction to Theoretical Linguistics* (1968), *Chomsky* (1970), and, as editor, *New Horizons in Linguistics* (1970).

PIETER SEUREN is Reader in the Philosophy of Language at Nijmegen University, Holland. He is the author of *Operators and Nucleus: A Contribution to the Theory of Grammar* (1969), and the editor of *Generative
viii Notes on the contributors


Östen Dahl is Docent in General Linguistics at the University of Göteborg. He is the author of Topic and Comment: A Study in Russian and General Transformational Grammar (1969), and has written articles for Language, Scando-Slavica, and Synthese as well as textbooks in linguistics. His research interests are in semantics, theory of grammar, logic and language.

Colin Biggs is a Research Student in Linguistics at the University of Cambridge. His principal research interests are in linguistic theory and philosophy of language.

J. A. W. Kamp has held teaching posts at the University of California Los Angeles, Cornell University, the University of Amsterdham and the University of London. His research and publications have been primarily concerned with tense logic, modal logic, intensional logic, and the formal semantics and pragmatics of natural languages.

Franz von Kutschera is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Regensburg. He is the author of Die Antinomien der Logik (1964), Elementare Logik (1967), Einführung in die moderne Logik (1971) with A. Breitkopf, Wissenschaftstheorie-Grundzüge der allgemeinen Methodologie der empirischen Wissenschaften (1972), and Einführung in die Logik der Normen, Werte und Entscheidungen (1973). His principal research interests are in philosophical logic, philosophy of language, philosophy of science, epistemology.

Renate Bartsch is Professor of the Philosophy of Language at the University of Amsterdam. Her publications include Adverbialsemantik (1972), and, together with Theo Vennemann, Semantic Structures: A study in the Relation between Semantics and Syntax.

Carl H. Heidrich is at present leading a research group on formal linguistics at the University of Bonn. His publications include ‘Eine Einbettung von generativen Chomsky-Grammatiken in den Prädikatenkalkül’, in Forschungsberichte des IKP (1974), Vorlesungen über Montague-Grammatiken und Linguistische Logik (forthcoming), and, as editor, Formale Betrachtungen in Sprachtheorien (1975). His principal research
Notes on the contributors  ix

interests are in logic, model theory and semantics of natural languages, algebraic linguistics.

Arnim von Stechow is Professor of Linguistics at the University of Konstanz (Germany). His publications include Einführung in Theorie und Anwendung der generative Syntax (1973-4) with A. Kratzer and E. Pause and 'ε-λ-kontextfreie Sprachen. Ein Beitrag zu einer natürlichen formalen Semantik', Linguistische Berichte, 34.

Nicholas Jardine is Lecturer in History and Philosophy of Science and Senior Research Fellow, King's College, Cambridge. His publications include Mathematical Taxonomy (1971) and papers on the mathematical theory of classification and its applications. His main research interests are in philosophy of language, the role of natural kinds in scientific theories and renaissance concepts of method in mathematics and natural philosophy.

Timothy C. Potts is Lecturer in Philosophy at the University of Leeds. His publications include 'Fregean categorial grammar', in Logic, Language and Probability (1973), 'Modal logic and auxiliary verbs', in Semantics and Communication (1974), and 'Montague's semiotic: a syllabus of errors', in Proceedings of the Logic Conferences at the University of York, 1973 and 1974. His research interests are in formal linguistics, medieval philosophy, philosophy of mind, speculative theology, aesthetics.

George Lakoff is Professor of Linguistics at the University of California at Berkeley. He is one of the founders of the Generative Semantics movement in American Linguistics. His principal research has been devoted to showing why semantics, pragmatics and psychological processing need to be integrated into a theory of syntax, and how that might be done. He is the author of Irregularity in Syntax and numerous articles, especially, 'On generative semantics', 'Linguistics and natural logic', 'Conversational postulates' (with David Gordon), '“Hedges”': a study in meaning criteria and the logic of fuzzy concepts', and 'Introducing cognitive grammar' (with Henry Thompson).

Stephen Isard is at present with the Laboratory of Experimental Psychology at the University of Sussex. His publications include 'Free recall of self-embedded sentences' with G. A. Miller, 'Computability over arbitrary fields' with G. T. Herman, and 'Utterances as programs' with D. J. M. Davies.
x Notes on the contributors

Petr Gäll is a Professor at Charles University, Prague. His publications on general linguistics and generative grammar include Vývoj flexe v indoeuropských jazycích (The Development of Inflection in IE Languages) (1958), Die Infinitive im Rigveda (1958), Generativní popis jazyka a česká deklinace (Generative Description of Language and the Czech Declension) (1967), and, as the main author, A Functional Approach to Syntax (1969), Topic, Focus and Generative Semantics (1973), and Functional Generative Grammar in Prague (1974).

Theo Vennemann is Professor of Linguistics at the University of California, Los Angeles and Professor-elect at the University of Munich. His publications include ‘Explanation in syntax’, in Syntax and Semantics (1973), ‘An explanation of drift’, in Word Order and Word Order Change, Schuchardt, the Neogrammarians, and the Transformational Theory of Phonological Change (1972) with Terence H. Wilbur, and Semantic Structures: A Study in the Relation between Semantics and Syntax. His research interests are in the theory of grammar and of grammar change.

Yorick Wilks has worked at Cambridge, Stanford, and now in Switzerland, on the analysis of the structure of natural language within the Artificial Intelligence paradigm. He has written numerous articles and is the author of Grammar, Meaning and the Machine Analysis of Language (1972).

Joseph Emonds is an Assistant Professor at the University of California, Los Angeles. His publications include ‘The place of linguistics in American Society’, in Papers from the 7th Meeting of the Chicago Linguistic Society, and ‘A reformulation of Grimm’s Law’, in Contributions to Generative Phonology. His principle research interest is in the development of the extended standard theory of generative syntax, and the results of most of this work will be collected in his forthcoming book, Transformational Approach to English Syntax: Root, Structure-Preserving, and Local Transformations.

Catherine Fuchs is at present a Lecturer in Formal Linguistics at the University of Paris, and is engaged on research on the formal semantics of natural language at the Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique. She is the author of Considerations théoriques à propos du traitement formel du language (1970), Théorie de l’enonciation et problèmes de prédication (1972), Ordinateurs, programmation et langues naturelles (1974), Analyse
Notes on the contributors

du discours et linguistique (1975), and Initiation aux linguistiques contemporaines.


Maurice Gross is Professor of Linguistics at the University of Paris and Director of the Laboratoire d’Automatique Documentaire et Linguistique. His major publications include Notions sur les grammaires formelles (1966) with A. Lentin, Grammaire transformationnelle du français (1968), Mathematical Models in Linguistics (1972) and Méthodes en syntaxe (1974). His research interest are in the problems in the foundation of syntax, formalization of syntactic rules and of generative transformational grammars.


John R. Ross is Professor of Linguistics at the Massachusetts Institute of Technology. His Ph.D. thesis was entitled ‘Constraints on Variables in Syntax’. His research interests are in universal grammar and the relationship of syntax and semantics.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I should like to express my thanks to King’s College, Cambridge for having supported the colloquium from which these papers issue and to the Department of Linguistics, Cambridge University, for its help with the physical organization of the colloquium. In addition special thanks are due to Jacqueline Mapes and Angela Zvesper for their help in running the colloquium and preparing the manuscripts for publication. And finally, I would like to thank Colin Biggs, Bernard Comrie, Andrew Crompton, John Hawkins, and Nigel Vincent for their help in editing the manuscripts.

E.L.K.
INTRODUCTION

The papers in this volume are those given at the Cambridge Colloquium on Formal Semantics of Natural Language, April 1973. The purpose of that colloquium was twofold: to stimulate work in natural language semantics and to bring together linguists, philosophers, and logicians working in different countries and, often, from different points of view. Both purposes were, it seems to us, achieved, though of course it was not feasible to represent all countries and all points of view at a single conference.

The questions treated in the colloquium papers represent the following current areas of interest: problems of quantification and reference in natural language, the application of formal logic to natural language semantics, the formal semantics of non-declarative sentences, the relation between natural language semantics and that of programming languages, formal pragmatics and the relation between sentences and their contexts of use, discourse meaning, and the relation between surface syntax and logical meaning.

The papers have been loosely grouped under the six rubrics given in the table of contents. These rubrics were not given to the authors in advance and are intended only as a rough guide to the reader.

E.L.K.