Richard Wollheim on the Art of Painting

Art as Representation and Expression

Richard Wollheim is one of the dominant figures in the philosophy of art, whose work has shown not only how paintings create their effects but why they remain important to us. His influential writings have focused on two core, interrelated questions: How do paintings depict? How do they express feelings?

In this collection of new essays, a group of distinguished thinkers in the fields of art history and philosophical aesthetics offers a critical assessment of Wollheim’s theory of art. Among the themes under discussion are Wollheim’s explanation of pictorial representation in terms of seeing-in, his views of artistic expression as a type of complex projection, and his notion of the internal spectator. In the final essay, Wollheim himself responds to the contributors.

Given the high level of international recognition that Wollheim’s work has enjoyed for many years, this book will be eagerly sought out by all serious students of the theory of art, whether in departments of philosophy or art history.

Rob van Gerwen is Lecturer in Philosophy at the University of Utrecht.
Richard Wollheim on the Art of Painting

Art as Representation and Expression

Edited by

ROB VAN GERWEN

Utrecht University
Contents

List of Contributors vii
Relevant Works by Richard Wollheim and Their Abbreviations as Used in This Volume ix
Preface xi
Introduction 1

Part One: Representation

1 On Pictorial Representation 13
RICHARD WOLLHEIM

2 Wollheim on Pictorial Representation 28
JERROLD LEVINSON

3 The Limits of Twofoldness: A Defence of the Concept of Pictorial Thought 39
ANDREW HARRISON

4 A Hypothesis About Seeing-In 59
MONIQUE ROELOFS

5 Communication and the Art of Painting 75
ANTHONY SAVILE

6 Twofoldness: From Transcendental Imagination to Pictorial Art 85
PAUL CROWTHER

Part Two: Expression

7 Wollheim on Correspondence, Projective Properties, and Expressive Perception 101
MALCOLM BUDD

8 The Artistry of Depiction 112
MICHAEL PODRO

9 Style and Value in the Art of Painting 121
CAROLYN WILDE
Contents

10 Expression as Representation
ROB VAN GERWEN

11 Wollheim on Expression (and Representation)
GRAHAM MCFEE

Part Three: The Internal Spectator

12 Viewing Making Painting
SVETLANA ALPERS

13 The Staging of Spectatorship
RENEE VAN DE VALL

14 Presentation or Representation
SUSAN L. FEAGIN

15 The Case for the Internal Spectator: Aesthetics or Art History?
CAROLINE VAN ECK

16 The Spectator in the Picture
ROBERT HOPKINS

17 A Word on Behalf of “the Merely Visual”
MICHAEL BAXANDALL

Part Four: Reply

18 A Reply to the Contributors
RICHARD WOLLHEIM

Bibliography

Index
List of Contributors

Svetlana Alpers is in the Department of History, University of California at Berkeley, Berkeley, CA, U.S.A.

Michael Baxandall is in London, Great Britain

Malcolm Budd is in the Department of Philosophy, University College London, Great Britain. E-mail: m.budd@ucl.ac.uk

Paul Crowther is in the Centre for Professional Ethics, University of Central Lancashire, Great Britain. E-mail: p.crowther1@uclan.ac.uk

Caroline van Eck is in the Department of Art History, Free University, Amsterdam, Netherlands. E-mail: eck_van_ca@let.vu.nl

Susan L. Feagin is in the Department of Philosophy, University of Missouri, Kansas City, MO, U.S.A. E-mail: feagin@philosophy.umkc.edu

Rob van Gerwen is in the Department of Philosophy, Utrecht University, Netherlands. E-mail: Rob.vanGerwen@phil.uu.nl.

WWW: http://www.phil.uu.nl/~rob/

Andrew Harrison is in the Department of Philosophy, University of Bristol, Great Britain. E-mail: Andrew.Harrison@Bristol.ac.uk

Robert Hopkins is in the Department of Philosophy, University of Birmingham, Great Britain. E-mail: HOPKINRD@m4-arts.bham.ac.uk

Jerrold Levinson is in the Department of Philosophy, University of Maryland, U.S.A. E-mail: JL32@UMAIL.UMD.EDU

Graham McFee is in the Chelsea School, University of Brighton, Great Britain. E-mail: G.J.McFee@bton.ac.uk

Michael Podro is in the Department of Art History and Theory, University of Essex, Great Britain. E-mail: MPodro@TALK21.com

Monique Roelofs is at Brown University, in the Pembroke Center for Teaching and Research on Women, Providence, RI, U.S.A. E-mail: Monique_Roelofs@Brown.edu

Anthony Savile is in the Department of Philosophy, King’s College, London, Great Britain. E-mail: Anthony.Savile@kcl.ac.uk
List of Contributors

Renée van de Vall is in the Department of Cultural Sciences, Maastricht University, Maastricht, Netherlands. E-mail: R.vandeVall@LK.UNIMAAS.NL

Carolyn Wilde is in the Department of Philosophy, University of Bristol, Bristol, Great Britain. E-mail: Carolyn.Wilde@bris.ac.uk

Richard Wollheim is in the Department of Philosophy, University of California at Berkeley, Berkeley, CA, U.S.A. E-mail: wollheim@uclink.berkeley.edu
Relevant Works by Richard Wollheim and Their Abbreviations as Used in This Volume


CR 1980. Criticism as Retrieval. AO2, 185–204.


Where an article has been reprinted in a collection of Wollheim’s essays, the page references in the text refer to that collection.
Preface

This book presents the offspring of a three-day conference on Richard Wollheim’s aesthetics, which was held (in Wollheim’s presence) in May 1997 in Utrecht, the Netherlands, augmented with a symposium from the *Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism* and Wollheim’s reply to the essays. The theme of the book – as of the conference – is the troubled conceptual relations in the art of painting between expression and representation. The conference, which took place in the best of spirits, benefited from a lively and ongoing discussion on one singularly coherent and stimulating body of thought, that is, Wollheim’s. Almost every chapter originating from the conference has been rewritten where appropriate in response to the discussions at the conference and to other chapters in this volume. This argumentative coherence is further served by Wollheim responses to the chapters. Thus, this volume presents a coherent body of work addressing issues raised by Wollheim but that are of importance far beyond his theory.

I would like to thank the authors for their supportive and stimulating cooperation, and particularly Graham McFee for his assistance in the editorial process. I would also like to express a word of thanks to the institutions that made it all happen: the Department of Philosophy of Utrecht University, the Leiden-Utrecht Zeno institute for research in philosophy, the Royal Dutch Academy of the Sciences (KNAW), the Foundation for Philosophy and Theology (SFT) of the Netherlands Organization for Scientific Research (NWO), and the Research Institute for History and Culture (OGC) of the department of Humanities, Utrecht University. Thanks also to Laura Lawrie, Matthew Lord, and Terence Moore of Cambridge University Press for their assistance in producing this book. Last, and emphatically, my thanks are due to Richard Wollheim for his supportive and energetic attitude and his never-diminishing strength of argument.

Rob van Gerwen
Utrecht, October 13, 1999
Richard Wollheim on the Art of Painting

Art as Representation and Expression