

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-03658-0 - Quotation and Cultural Meaning in Twentieth-Century Music

David Metzger

Excerpt

[More information](#)

Introduction

By the night of 28 April 1964 in Stuttgart, the fables had grown quite long. On this last show of a European tour, Charles Mingus had once again chosen his *Fables of Faubus*. Inspired and driven by Mingus, the bassist's quintet turned the piece into an almost forty-five minute tale, quite a change from the first recorded performance in 1959, which clocked in at around eight minutes.¹ The duration may have changed but the satiric spirit remained the same; it had even deepened over the intervening years. Conceived of in 1957, the piece bit at Governor Orval Faubus of Arkansas for calling in National Guard troops to block the integration of public schools. Seven years later, with Faubus still in office and the Civil Rights struggle having escalated, there were apparently more fables to tell. What Mingus added to the original work and what makes up a large part of that forty-five minutes were bits of American folk songs, many of them celebrating the supposed glory days of the Old South. Mingus especially drew upon those tunes in his solo, distorting them so as to expose the warped recollections in which that glory was enshrined. For instance, after improvising on the main theme with the rhythm section, he launches into a solo with a bit of "Dixie." No sooner has Mingus evoked the "land of cotton" than he quickly and unpredictably cuts off the melody, leaving it like a severed ribbon. What comes next is just as much of a surprise as the appearance of "Dixie." Mingus casts aside the torn tune and plays a brief flourish full of virtuosic figures, timbral shifts, and blue notes. With one phrase, he has created a sound world of his own, one inspired by African-American idioms. That world would be unthinkable in the Old South of "Dixie," as would be all the other fables offered by Mingus.

On the night of 22 April 1969 in London, the songs continued to come one after another. That evening marked the premiere of Peter Maxwell Davies's *Eight Songs for a Mad King*. The work was inspired by a small mechanical organ owned by George III with which the King attempted to teach birds to sing. It was the King's singing that shocked concertgoers that night. Maxwell Davies has the singer playing that part writhe in painful and grotesque sounds. For example, the King begins the

¹ The original recording was on the *Mingus Ah Um* LP (reissued on CD as Columbia CK 65512). A CD recording of the Stuttgart performance can be found on *Charlie Mingus, Live in Stuttgart! 1964* (unique jazz RKO 1038).

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-03658-0 - Quotation and Cultural Meaning in Twentieth-Century Music

David Metzger

Excerpt

[More information](#)*Quotation and Cultural Meaning*

seventh song with the opening phrase of the aria “Comfort Ye” from Handel’s *Messiah*. Little comfort is provided as he slides from a spectral falsetto to caterwauling to bass-voice croaking. Even more disturbing is the kitschy foxtrot that follows the crooked Handel. Here is music that evokes madness in the late twentieth century, but that would have certainly been viewed as “mad” – that is, if it could be imagined in the first place – during the time of George III.

Fables of Faubus and *Eight Songs for a Mad King* do not usually brush up against each other in the scholarly literature, or anywhere for that matter. The two seem to have little in common. The above sketches, though, point out a few similarities. Both had important performances or premieres in Europe during the 1960s, and the two also mock men in authority, be it a racist governor or an insane monarch. The most obvious link, as described above, is the use of quotation, but even here the ties appear slight. The two works are in very different idioms and the quoted materials come from even more contrasting repertoires: Southern American folk songs and Baroque oratorio. Moreover, they handle those materials in distinct ways. The jazz piece nonchalantly unfurls “Dixie” and then minces it with a bluesy retort. The music theater composition, on the other hand, heavily distorts the Handel aria and then hops into a realm of stylistic perversity.

These differences obscure one substantial similarity. In both works, quotation performs as a cultural agent – that is, it participates in and shapes cultural discourses. That role is intrinsic to the gesture. When a musician borrows from a piece, he or she draws upon not only a melody but also the cultural associations of that piece. Just as with a melody, a musician can work with and transform those associations. Those manipulations provide a means to comment on cultural topics and to reconfigure fundamental cultural relationships. That Mingus’s “Dixie” quotation comments on the pressing issues of the day is clear enough; what is less obvious is how the work rises above a protest shout and touches upon cultural relationships, particularly that between whiteness and blackness. Through that borrowing and others, *Fables* presents a specific view of that pair, one in which whiteness, as depicted in the lightly tossed-off “Dixie,” appears as a superficial and self-deluded realm. On the other hand, blackness, evoked in the following flourish, has timbral and melodic depths as well as the ability to fight back against whiteness, an ability displayed by the brusque ripping of the quotation.

The Handel borrowing in Maxwell Davies’s work reaches into madness, a realm that, as Foucault demonstrated, knots together different cultural strands.² *Eight Songs* rips out one particular strand from that

² Michel Foucault, *Madness and Civilization: A History of Insanity in the Age of Reason*, trans. Richard Howard (New York: Vintage Books, 1988).

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-03658-0 - Quotation and Cultural Meaning in Twentieth-Century Music

David Metzger

Excerpt

[More information](#)*Introduction*

knot, remembrance of the past, and displays how excessive reminiscence can be crippling. With that point, the work interacts with another basic cultural relationship, the bond between past and present. Through the spectacle of a mad king, Maxwell Davies comments on the imposing weight that music from previous centuries places on contemporary musical life and how the mass of that tradition can lead to creative anguish, distortions, and even silence.³ Mingus's work also touches upon the relationship between past and present, although shaping it in very different terms. His quotation of "Dixie" and other tunes rejects the past of the grand Old South, and his own celebratory virtuosic licks proclaim a present free from the violence and pain upon which that era was erected.

This book explores how quotation has served as a cultural agent in twentieth-century music. As the above two examples illustrate, this study looks at the role of quotation in a wide range of styles, including classical, experimental, jazz, and popular idioms. In addition, works from other arts are brought into the discussion. An account of related borrowing practices in painting, film, and poetry enhances the study of musical quotation by showing how those works use borrowing to similar or contrasting effects in engaging cultural discourses. Not only is the stylistic and artistic ground vast but so is the cultural terrain. The interaction between quotation and an array of cultural areas will be discussed, including race, childhood, madness, utopia, the mass media, and the relationship between past and present. Such a broad focus provides many different vantage points from which to view quotation.

With that focus, this study steps into the young and growing field of musical borrowing. Scholars have long explored how musicians incorporate elements of other pieces into new works. That research has traditionally focused on individual composers and repertoires, such as Handel's operatic borrowings or the use of chants as tenors in Notre Dame organum. New approaches to borrowing, in contrast, have opened up much wider perspectives.⁴ They, for instance, have looked at how borrowing practices extend over different styles and periods. Taking a cue from these approaches, this book considers the uses of quotation in various idioms. Only one period, however, is discussed here, albeit a very diverse one. That diversity in part makes the twentieth century arguably the richest era for a study of quotation. That century had an unprecedented awareness of music from the past and that of other styles and cultures. Not surprisingly, quotation became a

³ The work's relationship to madness and the past is discussed in chapter three.

⁴ J. Peter Burkholder has been instrumental in shaping these new approaches to borrowing. See his "The uses of existing music: musical borrowing as a field," *Music Library Association Notes* 50 (1994), 851–70, and "Borrowing," in *The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, 2nd edn, ed. Stanley Sadie (London: Macmillan, 2001), vol. 4, 5–8.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-03658-0 - Quotation and Cultural Meaning in Twentieth-Century Music

David Metzger

Excerpt

[More information](#)*Quotation and Cultural Meaning*

prevalent, if not indispensable, gesture for musicians in confronting the spectrum of music surrounding them. As this study explores, the gesture also provided musicians with a means of confronting a range of cultural discourses.

The new approaches to borrowing break additional ground by viewing borrowing not as a single practice, one often indiscriminately referred to as quotation or parody, but rather as a larger mode of music-making comprising different practices, such as quotation and parody, as well as allusion, modeling, and paraphrase, among others.⁵ As J. Peter Burkholder makes clear, the lines between these categories are not fixed. Quite the contrary, they frequently “intermingle,” a behavior run rampant in the Ives works that he examines.⁶ Still, there are some properties that distinguish quotation. That practice, as defined here, refers to the placement of parts of a pre-existent piece in a new composition or performance. The use of actual material from a piece separates quotation from allusion and paraphrase, which broadly evoke works, styles, or textures. Quotation is also set apart by the prominence of the borrowing, which is made to stick out from the surrounding music.⁷ That conspicuity contrasts with the unobtrusive, usually background, role played by borrowed elements in parody, cantus firmus, and modeling.

Quotation is also characterized by the use of brief excerpts, like the bits of patriotic songs that shoot through Ives’s works. In the first and third movements of George Rochberg’s *Music for the Magic Theater*, to give another example, flecks of Mahler, Mozart, and Beethoven glimmer in the dark dissonant music. What then to make of the second movement, which consists of a re-orchestration of almost an entire Mozart Adagio? Does a near fifty-measure block constitute a quotation? In some ways, yes. Like the scraps of Mahler, Mozart, and Beethoven, it stands out as a foreign element from the surrounding music, a patch of tranquil past inserted into the dissonant fracas of the outer movements. Moreover, the Adagio remains a fragment, cut off before it can finish, just like the tattered phrases of Mahler and Beethoven. Finally, a swarm of quotations from Stockhausen, Webern, and Mahler works takes flight after the Adagio suddenly collapses. In that flock of fragments, the Mozart comes across as a quotation itself, a piece of the past that has been recalled and then falls apart.

⁵ For a breakdown of different practices, see Burkholder, “The uses of existing music,” and “Borrowing.”

⁶ J. Peter Burkholder, *All Made of Tunes: Charles Ives and the Uses of Musical Borrowing* (New Haven and London: Yale University, 1995), 4–5.

⁷ Of course, many composers have embedded hidden quotations in their works, using them to make veiled personal or political statements.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-03658-0 - Quotation and Cultural Meaning in Twentieth-Century Music

David Metzger

Excerpt

[More information](#)*Introduction*

Viewing Rochberg's movement as such is not an attempt to lock it in the category of quotation and thereby fasten the lines separating that category from other ones. The above discussion is instead meant to loosen those lines. The Rochberg movement typifies a type of borrowing that became more and more common during the twentieth century. That practice can be seen in pieces that absorb whole or near-whole compositions and rework them to various degrees, often combining them with new materials. As the Rochberg movement shows, this type of borrowing overlaps with quotation. The amount of shared ground between the two varies with each piece, as seen in the following discussions of Luciano Berio's *Sinfonia*, the third movement of which builds upon the Scherzo from Mahler's Second Symphony, and John Oswald's "DAB," which offers a "revised performance" of Michael Jackson's "Bad."

These works and similar ones take elements of quotation far afield into new realms. By following these pieces, this study runs the risk of leaving quotation behind altogether. That point is indeed reached. The last chapter looks at the role of cover songs in Sandra Bernhard's film *Without You I'm Nothing*. Those songs form a distinct borrowing practice – one, which at its best, is characterized by a singer reconceiving in original ways a tune intimately connected with another artist. Bernhard's covers have been welcomed here for they broaden our understanding of quotation. The film, for instance, uses borrowing – the covers – to comment on the act of borrowing, touching upon issues related to quotation and other practices. In addition, Bernhard's songs take on a range of cultural issues, from race to celebrity, and reveal unique ways in which borrowing acts as a cultural agent.

Cover songs also fit into this study, for they exploit the same basic two-part gesture manipulated by quotation and other borrowing approaches. One part of that gesture is what can be called the original, that is, the material taken from an outside source. The original is the fragment as it exists in that source, prior to any alterations made to it. As such, it never sounds in the new work, for there is always some degree of alteration in bringing that fragment into its new surroundings. Nonetheless, the original maintains a strong presence. All transformations are viewed in relation to it, making it a constant point of comparison. In addition, no matter how small or slight, it transports the weighty cultural discourses of the borrowed work into the new one, forcing the borrowing musician and listener to confront those associations. The other part of a borrowing is the transformation, the name given to the fragment as it exists in the new work. As the term states, this side of the gesture involves any alterations made to the original as well as the changed form it assumes in its new context. The transformation is the borrowing as we hear it; however, we hear more than just it, for the original still

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-03658-0 - Quotation and Cultural Meaning in Twentieth-Century Music

David Metzger

Excerpt

[More information](#)*Quotation and Cultural Meaning*

demands our attention, even if never stated. Borrowing then creates an unceasing interaction between the two sides, between both the original and the altered musical material, and the original and the new cultural associations. That interaction creates the thrill of hearing what happens when music takes on new life within music.

With quotation, this two-part design is heightened. The borrowed material is most often familiar or, if not so, it at least stands apart by virtue of being out of context. Such conspicuity intensifies the engagement between old and new, as we can hear how easily or reluctantly the borrowing settles into its new locale. Once inside, it continually points outside, as the prominence of the borrowing prods us to look back to its origins. At the same time, quotation typically involves a range of transformational techniques. Fragmentation, expansion, rhythmic skewing, stylistic metamorphosis – these are only some of the things that can be done with borrowed elements. This manipulation of pre-existent material adds another dimension to the play between old and new, as we hear what new guises the old can assume. In his discussion of the electronic work *Hymnen*, Stockhausen provided an apt description of the two-sided dynamics of quotation. According to him, the practice involves a rich exchange between the “what” and the “how,” that is, the gesture has us hear “what” music has been borrowed and “how” it has been changed. The more familiar and obvious the “what,” the more we are drawn into the “how,” and the more captivating the “how,” the more we can appreciate anew the “what.”

It is the ways in which quotation handles the “what” and the “how” that make it so effective a cultural agent. The gesture latches on to a specific work, often a familiar one, and places that work squarely in front of us. The borrowed material is tightly gripped and prominently featured rather than being merely alluded to or buried in the background. This directness calls attention to the cultural associations of the original, for the more discernible and intact the borrowing, the more apparent and whole those associations. In other words, quotation puts a new twist on the maxim that to name something is the most direct way of evoking that object and what it stands for. Here, to state the piece itself is the clearest way of summoning that piece and its cultural dimensions.

Once the borrowing is evoked, the exchange between the original and new work central to cultural agency begins. That exchange, of course, can start only if the listener can recognize the quotation. As described above, quotations are displayed more markedly than other types of borrowing, but that prominence does not ensure that the listener will be able to identify the particular borrowing. The listener has to be able to “name” the quotation in order to understand fully what it stands for. Recognition then forms a crux for quotation, especially in its role as a

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-03658-0 - Quotation and Cultural Meaning in Twentieth-Century Music

David Metzger

Excerpt

[More information](#)*Introduction*

cultural agent.⁸ Simply put, if a borrowing is not detected then it and its cultural resonances go unheard. For example, I initially did not perceive Schoenberg's self-borrowing of an earlier song that dashes through the orchestra in the closing scene of *Erwartung*. However, once discovered, it – a few fragmentary measures – loomed. The quotation demanded my attention, constantly nudging me to ask what it was doing there and what light it shed upon the ambiguous operatic landscape in which Schoenberg had dropped it. My answers can be found in the ruminations on hysteria, memory, and gender found in chapter three.

That some quotations can sneak by without being spotted points to different approaches to the gesture. As with the *Erwartung* fragment, a few borrowings amount to personal asides, and are accordingly shaded if not hidden outright. Others, such as those in Eliot's *The Waste Land* (which is discussed alongside Schoenberg's opera below), are purposely obscure, *recherché* tokens of the creator's elitism. In either case, once revealed – as they almost always are – these borrowings are no longer hushed. Quite the opposite: having remained reticent for so long, they, like the Schoenberg quotation, have much to say and keep saying it to us.

In contrast to the obscure and hidden borrowings are the obvious borrowings. Some composers draw upon materials so well known that they would stand out no matter where they are placed. Prominent and familiar, these borrowings have much to say in a cultural dialogue. They grab the listener's attention right away and have him or her go back and forth between the associations of the known and those of the new work. Oswald's "DAB," for example, draws upon the familiar Jackson hit "Bad," so familiar that many listeners probably would turn off the tune rather than hear it again. They may, though, keep Oswald's version turned on, for not only does he scramble the song in beguiling ways but he also scrambles the cultural associations of the piece, having us discern the studio artificiality of the supposedly real person that we know as Michael Jackson.

With many quotations, it is not a simple matter of being recognized or not. Some can be noticed but not identified. For instance, most listeners will not spot the Ghanaian national anthem in Stockhausen's *Hymnen*; neither will they catch "Ben Bolt" in Ives's *Central Park in the Dark*. They should, however, be able to perceive musical strands that stand apart from the surrounding work. That distinction can be drawn on several different levels, including style (the national anthem or parlor song

⁸ For a discussion of the various facets of recognition and its implications for the aesthetic effectiveness of the gesture, see Jeanette Bicknell, "The problem of reference in musical quotation: a phenomenological approach," *The Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism* 59 (2001), 185–91.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-03658-0 - Quotation and Cultural Meaning in Twentieth-Century Music

David Metzger

Excerpt

[More information](#)*Quotation and Cultural Meaning*

versus the modern idiom), tonal/atonal, and, as with *Hymnen*, acoustic/electronic sound. Such contrast is not possible to anywhere near the same extent in the music of earlier periods, which embeds acoustic, tonal borrowings in acoustic, tonal idioms. Those rich juxtapositions are part of the reason why quotation thrived in twentieth-century music, especially as a cultural agent. Even at this basic level of contrast, the gesture can still play that role. To continue with *Hymnen*, anthems, as a genre, bring to a work a load of associations, including state ceremony, military, and authority. Of course, that load grows larger and more specific when an anthem is linked to a particular country. It is at that stage that this study enters. It identifies the quotations and then quickly turns to the cultural role played by those borrowings. Whether obscure, familiar, or just familiar-sounding, all quotations have broad repercussions in the cultural arena; following those consequences requires keen ears and eyes for they often lead to areas and issues that many listeners would never anticipate.

Other scholars have followed these fanning cultural trails. Of note is Charles Ballantine's study of Ives. Ballantine views quotations as enacting a "dialectic" between "the fragment" and "the new musical context."⁹ That dialectic gets at the concept of cultural agency pursued in this study. Ballantine similarly focuses on the play of associations between the original and its transformation. Although he broadly paints those associations as "semantic," he brings out specific cultural topics in his study of Ives, whose quotation works he sees as touching upon notions of community, the relationship between humanity and nature, and "the kaleidoscopic vigor of American life."¹⁰

How those cultural associations are produced is where this study and Ballantine's part ways. As laid out here, the transformation never assumes "primacy" over the original or provides the exclusive "framework" through which it can be "understood." The original, as stated above, maintains a strong presence in the new work, in terms of both its distinct musical shape and its cultural meanings. The new work, contrary to Ballantine, cannot so easily control, let alone "strip," those associations.¹¹ What makes the original so obdurate is that it, as exemplified in the pieces discussed here, brings to the new work loaded cultural discourses. They are imposing blocks, comprising a dense web of ideas developed over the course of centuries. Once evoked they can never be dominated; rather, a new piece can only interact with them.

⁹ Charles Ballantine, *Music and its Social Meanings* (New York: Garden and Breach Science Publication, 1984), 73–74. Ballantine views his model as relevant to a range of other twentieth-century composers, not just Ives.

¹⁰ *Ibid.*, 83, 87–89.

¹¹ *Ibid.*, 73–74.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-03658-0 - Quotation and Cultural Meaning in Twentieth-Century Music

David Metzger

Excerpt

[More information](#)*Introduction*

Another study to look at the cultural agency of quotation is Glenn Watkins's *Pyramids at the Louvre: Music, Culture, and Collage from Stravinsky to the Postmodernists*.¹² That book astutely examines the role performed by borrowing in a variety of twentieth-century cultural movements, including primitivism and neoclassicism. Watkins treats a group of borrowing practices, all of them lumped under the ambiguous heading of "collage." That practice is made even more ambiguous by the lack of any explanation as to how collage operates as a borrowing strategy. Cultural elements go in and come out, but the inner workings of collage remain a mystery.

This book and Watkins's differ in terms of the range of works and cultural topics discussed. *Pyramids at the Louvre* deals almost exclusively with classical music, making rare and brief excursions into jazz and popular repertoires. This book, in contrast, examines the uses of quotation across a spectrum of styles. Watkins's work is also weighted toward the first half of the century, relatively neglecting the role of borrowing in the latter half. This study too is chronologically out of balance, though the scales are tipped in the opposite direction. As explored here, the second half of the century gave rise to a multitude of approaches to quotation, from 1960s collage works to rap sampling. One other difference between this work and Watkins's is the cultural realms covered in each. This book explores several realms – childhood, madness, the mass media, nostalgia, and utopia, among others – that are only touched upon or not mentioned at all by Watkins. By pointing out omissions and thin patches in Watkins's work, I do not mean to slight his accomplishment; rather, a comparison of his book and this one only serves to draw attention to the ample room for research in this expansive topic.

With such a spacious topic, this project makes no attempt to be comprehensive – obviously no single book could encompass the infinite interactions between borrowing and the dense strands of twentieth-century culture. It instead concentrates on a select group of works, treating them as case studies. Each study merits a separate chapter, which discusses how quotation engages a specific cultural discourse. In the order of the presented chapters, those discourses are childhood, race, madness, utopia, theft, and celebrity.

Pursuing such a broad cultural scope, this discussion brings together a diverse collection of topics and works, everything from Ellington's use of spirituals in *Black and Tan Fantasy* to Oswald's dismantling of Jackson's voice in "DAB." Within this diversity, several topics reappear, serving as points of both orientation and elaboration. One such recurring subject is the relationship between past and present. That

¹² Glenn Watkins, *Pyramids at the Louvre: Music, Culture, and Collage from Stravinsky to the Postmodernists* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1994).

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-03658-0 - Quotation and Cultural Meaning in Twentieth-Century Music

David Metzger

Excerpt

[More information](#)*Quotation and Cultural Meaning*

relationship is crucial to the study of the cultural agency of quotation. On one hand, quotation by nature involves that relationship, as it creates a new (present) take on pre-existent (past) materials, be it the past of centuries ago or a few years back. On the other hand, that relationship forms a significant cultural site in itself. An evocation of the past not only tells us how the present perceives a distant period but also how it views itself in relation to that time. So significant is that pair that other cultural topics group around it. The works to be examined all involve such dense clusters. For example, Ives's evocations of the past tie into both Victorian conceptions of childhood and the contemporary anxiety over new technologies and urbanization. In his songs, nostalgia serves as a way of escaping those concerns and finding refuge in an idealized nineteenth-century small-town childhood. Nostalgia is not restricted to memories of youthful days. Many musicians have fallen under its spell in dealing with the tensions between past and present. Not surprisingly, nostalgia serves as another recurring topic in this book.

One other cultural relationship that appears in different chapters is that between blackness and whiteness. As in Mingus's *Fables of Faubus*, quotation can be used to set the terms of that relationship by offering representations of both racial categories and establishing a dynamic between them. Given the variety of materials that can be drawn upon and the numerous ways in which they can be handled, that relationship can assume innumerable forms. This book looks at how Ellington, Bernhard, and pop and experimental musicians using samplers have approached a racial pairing that continues to shape American culture.

This discussion also keeps coming back to larger questions dealing with the act of quotation, specifically what is the effect of that practice on those who use it and in how many different ways can it be employed? The first query may come as a surprise, for it rarely, if at all, pops up in accounts of musical borrowing. Yet many works featuring quotation directly or indirectly pose that question. We need to hear when a work raises it and then attempt to find an answer. To do so is to open up new perspectives on borrowing, as that inquiry shifts attention from the play of quoted and new materials in a piece to the musician who invents that play. In particular, we can see how the individuality of the musician – how he or she perceives him or herself – is manifested in that play.

Borrowing, in its many forms including quotation, is a creative act that stirs different, often polarized, types of self-perception. On one hand, the act is ridden with fears of creative sterility and desperation, the musician who has nothing original to say and thus feeds upon the works of others. These fears can create paralyzing anxieties, even moments of self-abjection. At the end of *Without You I'm Nothing*, for example, Bernhard breaks down on stage and castigates herself with names like