

Factionalism in Chinese Communist Politics

Factionalism is widely understood to be one of the distinguishing characteristics of Chinese politics. The Chinese Communist Party has a long history of purges and infighting among its elite members and, after 1949, of seemingly irrational and frequently vicious struggles for succession to leadership. Almost all of the successors to Mao and Deng, with the exception of China's President Jiang Zemin – including Liu Shaoqi, Lin Biao, Hua Guofeng, Hu Yaobang, and Zhao Ziyang – were purged. What is not as well understood is how this divisive feature could coexist with another linchpin of post-1949 political power and legitimacy: Party unity. Nor do scholars agree upon the exact relationship between factional politics and policy outcomes. In this book Jing Huang examines the role of factionalism in leadership relations and policy making. His detailed knowledge of intra-Party politics offers scholars and students a new understanding of long-disputed struggles behind the walls of leadership in Zhongnanhai.

Huang traces the development of factional politics from its roots in the various "mountaintops," or power bases, headed by guerrilla leaders during the communist revolution, and describes the enduring impact of the personal bonds formed between Mao and his supporters at the Yan'an Round Table. He explains how factionalism led to Mao's unleashing of the Cultural Revolution, and how Deng Xiaoping manipulated factionalism to orchestrate his rise to power.

The nature of Chinese Communist Party politics, Huang argues – including highly personalized relationships between political contenders and their supporters, a barely institutionalized political process, and uncertain rules of decision making – has allowed factionalism to prevail. Huang's analysis concludes that it is not power struggles that give rise to factional activities, as the predominant theories on leadership relations and decision making presume; it is factionalism that turns power into an overriding goal in CCP politics. Thus, factional activities were a key source of inconsistency in Party policy; policy outcomes switched constantly between "Left-adventurism" and "Right-conservatism" under Mao's leadership and between those favoring "emancipation of the mind" and "socialist spiritual civilization" in the Deng era. Huang asserts, however, that, paradoxically, factionalism is not necessarily unstable and chaotic. In the long run, it may play a positive role in political development.

Jing Huang is Associate Professor of Political Science at Utah State University and Research Associate at the John King Fairbank Center for East Asian Research at Harvard University.



Cambridge Modern China Series

Edited by William Kirby, Harvard University

Other Books in the Series

Warren I. Cohen and Li Zhao, eds., Hong Kong under Chinese Rule: The Economic and Political Implications of Reversion

Tamara Jacka, Women's Work in Rural China: Change and Continuity in an Era of Reform

Shiping Zheng, Party vs. State in Post-1949 China: The Institutional Dilemma

Wenfang Tang and William L. Parish, Chinese Urban Life under Reform: The Changing Social Contract

Michael Dutton, Streetlife China

Edward S. Steinfeld, Forging Reform in China: The Fate of State-Owned Industry



Factionalism in Chinese Communist Politics

JING HUANG

Utah State University





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo

Cambridge University Press
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521622844

© Jing Huang 2000

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2000
This digitally printed first paperback version 2006

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data

Huang, Jing.
Factionalism in Chinese Communist politics / Jing Huang.
p. cm. – (Cambridge modern China series)
Includes bibliographical references and index.
ISBN 0-521-62284-0

Chung-kuo kung ch'an tang – History.
 Political purges – China.
 China – Politics and government – 1949 – I. Title. II. Series.

JQ1519.A5H8725 2000 324.251'075'09 - dc21

99-29408 CIP

ISBN-13 978-0-521-62284-4 hardback ISBN-10 0-521-62284-0 hardback

ISBN-13 978-0-521-03258-2 paperback ISBN-10 0-521-03258-X paperback



For Xiuping



Contents

List of Figures and Tables Preface List of Abbreviations		page xi xiii	
		xvii	
	Introduction	1	
	Factionalism in Leadership Relations and Decision Making Western Applysis of Factionalism in Leadership Relations	1	
	Western Analysis of Factionalism in Leadership Relations and Decision Making	3	
	Conditions for the Development of Factionalism in CCP		
	Politics	6	
	Mountaintops and Leadership Relations with Mao in Command	8	
	The Two-Front Arrangement, Elite Conflicts, and Policy Inconsistency "Princips Un Suggestors" and the Visious Cycle of	12	
	"Bringing Up Successors" and the Vicious Cycle of Succession Struggles	18	
	Continuity and Changes: Factionalism in the Deng Period		
1	Factionalism, the Puzzle of Chinese Communist Politics	26	
	Conflict Models and Their Explanations of Factionalism Factionalism, a Puzzle of CCP Politics	26 42	
2	Factionalism and the Political System in China	55	
	Conditions for the Development of Factionalism Factional Activities and the Shaping of Leadership Relations	55 74	
3	The Establishment of the Yan'an Round Table	107	
~	Mao Zedong Strives to Achieve the Party Leadership	107	

ix



Contents

	The Yan'an Rectification and the Establishment of	
	the Yan'an Round Table	119
	Mountaintops under Mao's Command	141
4	The Transition of the Yan'an Round Table	159
	Policy Differences: Prelude to the Gao-Liu Power	
	Struggle	160
	The Gao-Rao Affair: An Inevitable Clash	173
	The Structural Change of the Yan'an Round Table	197
5	Crises in Leadership Relations with the Two-Front	
	Arrangement	211
	The Rise of the Party Bureaucrats	213
	Mao versus the Party State	238
	Conclusion: The Overall Crisis of the Yan'an Round Table	256
	Appendix 5.1: The Game between Mao and Liu in	266
	Early 1962	260
	Appendix 5.2: The Game with the Deng Factor in Early 1962	264
_		20
6	The Collapse of the Yan'an Round Table and	0.05
	the Unleashing of Factionalism	267
	The Destruction of the Party System	268
	Lin Biao's Rise and Fall: Disconnection of the Military	
	from the Yan'an Round Table	287
	Deng Xiaoping's Return and Fall: The Collapse of the	20/
	Yan'an Round Table	325
7	Deng Xiaoping's Dominance: Factionalism Prevails over	
	the Party Spirit	350
	The Establishment of Deng Xiaoping's Dominance	350
	Factionalism over the Party Spirit	365
	Deng's Struggle to Maintain His Dominance	387
8	Conclusion	413
	Factionalism and Political Outcomes in China	411
	The Impact of Factionalism on Chinese Politics	417
Sa	elected Bibliography	429
	Seiecieu Bionogrupny Index	

X



Figures and Tables

FIGURES

I.1	The Structure of the Yan'an Round Table	age	9
I.2	The Two-Front Arrangement, 1954–1966		13
2.1	The Process of Zhengdun (Rectification) Campaign		84
2.2	Prisoners' Dilemma between the Leader and His		
	Successor		89
2.3	The New Player in a Succession Struggle: Working		
	Model		94
2.4	Extensive Form of the Game: Players Move		
	Simultaneously		101
2.5	Extensive Form of the Game: Deng Moves First		103
3.1	Reorganization of CCP Forces under Mao's Command,		
	August 1937		109
3.2	A Tentative Yan'an Round Table after the Sixth Plenum	,	
	November 1938		118
3.3	The Yan'an Rectification under Mao's Command		123
3.4	The Yan'an Round Table under Mao's Command		137
4.1	Civilian Leaders and Their Policy Areas (kou) in 1953		182
4.2	The Transition of the Yan'an Round Table at the Eighth		
	Party Congress, 1956		208
5. A 1	Normal Form of the Game between Mao and Liu		262
5.A2	Extensive Form of the Game between Mao and Liu		262
5.A3	The Game between Mao and Liu with the Deng Factor		266
6.1	The Ties between PLA Leaders and Their Mountaintops	3	288
6.2	A Transformed Yan'an Round Table after the Ninth		
	Party Congress		315
7.1	Leadership Relations under Deng Xiaoping's		
	Dominance, 1982		384

хi



Figures and Tables

8.1 8.2	Factionalism and Power Struggle in CCP Politics Factionalism and Policy Outcomes in CCP Politics	413 415
	TABLES	
2.1	Elite Conflicts and <i>Zhengdun</i> (Rectification) Campaigns since 1949	83
2.2	Preference Orders of Leader and Successor in a Prisoners' Dilemma	92
2.3	Hardliners' Preference Order on the Outcomes of a Succession Struggle	99
2.4	Strategies, Outcomes, and Payoffs of a Succession Struggle in Deng's Period	100
3.1	Major Mountaintops under Mao's Command (1949–1952)	152
4.1 4.2	An Ziwen's List of CCP Politburo Members Positions of the Military Leaders after the Gao-Rao	178
	Affair	205
5.1	Changes in Production Targets for 1967	214
5.2	High-Ranking Officers Implicated in Peng's Case	229
5.A1	Outcome, Strategy, and Payoffs in the Mao-Liu Game	261
5.A2 6.1	Outcome, Strategy, and Payoffs with the Deng Factor Liu's Whereabouts and the Happenings in Beijing,	265
	March 26–April 19	279
6.2 6.3	Factional Conflicts in the PLA RMCs (1967–1968) The Leadership Formed at the Tenth Party Congress	297
6.4	(August 24–28, 1973) Deng Xiaoping's Return and the Decline of Zhou	327
. m	Enlai's Power (1971–1973)	336
6.5	Deng's Progress and Mao's Criticism of the Gang of Four (1974–1976)	340
7.1	Personnel Arrangements at the Politburo Meeting (December 25, 1978)	364
7.2	Power Struggles between Deng and the Hardliners (1978–1987)	408



Preface

My interests in Chinese politics started in 1973-5 when I was receiving "reeducation" in a remote mountain village in Yunnan Province. In addition to heavy manual labor in the field, all the readings available to me there were the four-volume Selected Works of Mao Zedong, and the Yunnan Daily and People's Daily, which always arrived a week late. A tennager hungry for everything, material and spiritual, I virtually devoured every word in these publications. What fostered my interests in CCP politics, however, were the many questions I had in reading Mao's works and the gap between the newspaper propaganda and reality. I soon indulged myself in frequent correspondences with my friends in which we exchanged our ideas, knowledge, and opinions drawn from questions in Mao's works and the constantly changing situation during those turbulent years. Although such exchanges would continue for years, I actually tried to suppress my interests in CCP politics after I entered college, where I majored in English literature and later earned an M.A. degree in history. An essential reason was that the study of CCP politics was seen as a dangerous activity in China, for any steps outside the official line could result in a purge. Yet I could not really give up my interests in Chinese politics because my life experiences in the CCP political system made my desire for the answers insuppressible.

I was fortunate to sit in Roderick MacFarqhuar's class at Harvard University in 1987. His exhaustive analyses and his insights of political affairs in China have benefited my study tremendously, and his constant encouragement and unwavering support have always been a great source of inspiration. As my mentor, he read each chapter of my manuscript with such care that even a punctuation error would not escape his attention, and his advice and comments were perceptive and to the point. Working with MacFraquhar has been the most exciting and satisfactory



Preface

experience in my academic life. My gratitude to him is beyond expression.

My heartfelt thanks also go to Timothy Colten, whose expertise in Soviet politics has broadened the prospective of my study; to Jean Oi, whose sharp and apropos comments and critique have forced me to clarify my ideas more accurately with rigid analyses; and to Kenneth Shepsle, from whom I have learned not just game theory per se but what it can reveal so eloquently – that is, depending on the players' preferences, the rules and procedures determine the final outcomes. Thus, a political crisis is caused essentially by the failure of the process rather than by conflicting interests or policy disputes. Factional politics is prone to crisis not necessarily because of constant factional struggles, but because personal ties, or *guanxi*, often override the adopted rules and procedures in political interactions.

This book would not have been completed but for the generous support and help from numerous people and organizations. A Harvard-Yenching scholarship in 1986–8 permitted me to study at Harvard in the first place. Fellowships from the Mellon Foundation enabled me to concentrate on my research and writing in 1991-3. The late Professor Hu Hua in China gave me good advice on source materials. The more than two dozen people whom I interviewed in China - some of them are prominent Party historians - not only provided me with firsthand information and access to source materials but also shared their insights with me. Nancy Hearst at the John King Fairbank Center for East Asian Studies at Harvard University has offered the most crucial help in locating and sorting out source materials. She also edited the drafts of my first two chapters with painstaking care. In various stages of my work on this book, I have benefited from discussions with Ellis Joffe, Hao Yufan, and Wu Guoguang; from the thoughtful suggestions of Edward Steinfeld, who read the drafts of Chapters 4 and 5 with great care; and from the constructive comments and critiques of Andrew Nathan, who read the first draft of the manuscript in late 1994. I also wish to express my sincere thanks to the anonymous manuscript reviewers from whose relentless critiques and perceptive comments I have profited in revisions of the manuscript.

I am also indebted to a greater circle of friends, scholars, and colleagues from whose works and wisdom I have drawn in this study and to whom I can only express my gratitude by their acknowledgment in



Preface

my footnotes and bibliography. Any errors that remain are, of course, all mine. I am also grateful to those whose help was indispensable in bringing this book into print. Mary Child at Cambridge University Press has played an essential role in converting the manuscript into a publishable book. Brian MacDonald has been a truly devoted production editor, who made a painstaking effort to ready the manuscript for publication; working with him has not only been a pleasant experience but also a learning process. Anne Holmes has made an excellent index, which I believe has enhanced the general quality of this book.

My ultimate thanks, however, go to my wife, who sacrificed her own chances for an advanced degree so that I could fully concentrate on my work. With a full-time job as a librarian assistant, two young children, and a husband who usually showed up at midnight, she somehow managed to help me out, working as my research assistant, librarian, typist, and file keeper. This book is dedicated to her.



Abbreviations

AJPS American Journal of Political Science APSR American Political Science Review

AS Asian Survey BR Beijing Review

Cankao Zhonggong dangshi jiaoxue cankao ziliao (The CCP

History Teaching Reference Materials), compiled by Guofang daxue dangshi dangjian zhenggong jiaoyanshi (Teaching and Research Office of the Party's History, Construction, and Political Work, National Defense

University), 27 vols., 1986

CB Current Background

CC Central Committee of the CCP

CCB Central China Bureau
CCP Chinese Communist Party

CFEG Central Financial and Economic Group
CFEC Central Financial and Economic Commission

CLG Chinese Law and Government, a journal of translations,

Armonk, NY: M. E. Sharp, 1968-

CLOPCG The Collection of Laws and Orders of the People's

Central Government, Beijing: Law Press

CMC Central Military Commission

CO (military) commander CPB Central Plain Bureau

CPSU Communist Party of the Soviet Union

CQ China Quarterly
CR Cultural Revolution

CRG Cultural Revolutionary Group
CYLC Communist Youth League of China

xvii



GLF

Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-03258-2 - Factionalism in Chinese Communist Politics Jing Huang Frontmatter More information

Abbreviations

ECB East China Bureau **FCP** Four Cardinal Principles **FYP** Five-Year Plan

Great Leap Forward investment in capital construction ICC

The CCP Central Committee, Guanyu jianguo yilai dang Jueyi

> de ruogan lishi wenti de jueyi (The Resolution on Several Questions of Our Party's History since the Establishment of the PRC), Beijing: Sixth Plenum of the Eleventh

Central Committee, June 27, 1981

KMT Kuomintang (National Party)

Mao Zedong Thought **MZT**

North Bureau NB

NCFEC North China Financial and Economic Commission

NEB Northeastern Bureau **NPC** National People's Congress **NWB** Northwestern Bureau PB Party bureaucrats

PC National Party Congress of the CCP

PCProblems of Communism

PDPeople's Daily

People's Liberation Army **PLA PRC** People's Republic of China Politburo Standing Committee **PSC**

Regional Military Command (da junqu) **RMC**

RWZHu Hua, ed., Zhonggong lishi renwu zhuan (Biographies

of Personalities in CCP History), Taiyuan: Shanxi

People's Press, 1978-

State Economic Commission **SEC** SPC State Planning Commission

Chen Yun, Selected Works of Chen Yun, 2 vols., Beijing: **SWCY**

Foreign Languages Press, 1984

SWDXP Deng Xiaoping, Selected Works of Deng Xiaoping,

1975–1982, 2 vols., Beijing: Foreign Languages Press, 1984

SWLSO Liu Shaoqi, Selected Works of Liu Shaoqi, 3 vols.,

Beijing: Foreign Languages Press, 1984

SWMZD Mao Zedong, Selected Works of Mao Zedong, 5 vols.,

Beijing: Foreign Languages Press, 1981

xviii



Abbreviations

SWZEL Zhou Enlai, Selected Works of Zhou Enlai, 2 vols.,

Beijing: Foreign Languages Press, 1989

Wansui Mao Zedong sixiang wansui (Long Live Mao Zedong

Thought), 3 vols., n.p., 1967, 1969

Wengao Jianguo yilai Mao Zedong wengao (Manuscripts of Mao

Zedong since the Establishment of the PRC), compiled by Department for Research on Party Literature, CCP Central Committee, 13 vols., Beijing: CC Document

Press, 1987-98

Xuanbian Shierda yilai zhongyao wenxian xuanbian (Selection of

the Important Documents since the Twelfth Party Congress), compiled by Department for Research on Party Literature, CCP Central Committee, 2 vols.,

Beijing: People's Press, 1989

Xuandu Shiyijie sanzhong quanhui yilai zhongyao wenxian xuandu

(Selected Readings of the Important Documents since the Third Plenum of the Eleventh Party Congress), compiled by Department for Research on Party Literature, CCP Central Committee, 2 vols., Beijing: People's Press, 1987

Xulie Zhongguo renmin jiefangjun fazhan xulie 1927–1949

(The Development of the PLA Organizational System),

Beijing: PLA Press, 1985

Yanjiu 1 Dangshi yanjiu (The Study of the Party History)

Yanjiu 2 Zhonggong dangshi yanjiu (The Study of the CCP

History)

YB Yangtze Bureau YR Yan'an Rectification

Zhuanji Xuexi "lishi jueyi" zhuanji (Monograph on the Study of

"The Resolution on Several Questions of Our Party's History"), compiled by the Association of the CCP History, 3 vols., Beijing: Press of the Central Party School

of the CCP, 1982

Ziliao "Wenhua da geming" yanjiu ziliao (Research Materials

of "the Cultural Revolution"), compiled by Guofang daxue dangshi dangjian zhenggong jiaoyanshi (Teaching and Research Office of the Party's History, Construction, and Political Work, National Defense University), 3 vols.,

1988

xix