Music theory of almost all ages has relied on nature in its attempts to explain music. The understanding of what nature is, however, is subject to cultural and historical differences. In exploring ways in which music theory has represented and employed natural order since the scientific revolution, this volume asks some fundamental questions not only about nature in music theory, but also about the nature of music theory. In an array of different approaches, ranging from physical acoustics to theology and Lacanian psychoanalysis, these essays examine how the multifarious conceptions of nature, located variously between scientific reason and divine power, are brought to bear on music theory. They probe the changing representations and functions of nature in the service of music theory and highlight the ever-changing configurations of nature and music, as mediated by the music-theoretical discourse.

Suzannah Clark is a Research Fellow at Merton College, Oxford and Alexander Rehding is a Research Fellow at Emmanuel College, Cambridge.
Music Theory and Natural Order from the Renaissance to the Early Twentieth Century

EDITED BY
SUZANNAH CLARK AND
ALEXANDER REHDING
Contents

List of illustrations  page vii
List of contributors  ix
Acknowledgements  xi

Introduction  1
SUZANNAH CLARK AND ALEXANDER REHDING

PART I: THE DISENCHANTMENT AND RE-ENCHANTMENT OF MUSIC

1 Vincenzo Galilei, modernity and the division of nature  17
DANIEL K. L. CHUA

2 "Tis Nature's Voice": music, natural philosophy and the hidden world in seventeenth-century England  30
LINDA PHYLLIS AUSTERN

3 The 'gift of nature': musical 'instinct' and musical cognition in Rameau  68
DAVID E. COHEN

4 Nietzsche, Riemann, Wagner: when music lies  93
LESLIE DAVID BLASIUS

PART II: NATURAL FORMS — FORMING NATURE

5 The second nature of sonata form  111
SCOTT BURNHAM

6 August Halm's two cultures as nature  142
ALEXANDER REHDING
Contents

7 Seduced by notation: Oettingen’s topography of the major-minor system 161
   SUZANNAH CLARK

PART III: CONSTRUCTIONS OF IDENTITY

8 The gendered eye: music analysis and the scientific outlook in German early Romantic music theory 183
   IAN BIDDLE

9 On the primitives of music theory: the savage and subconscious as sources of analytical authority 197
   PETER A. HOYT

Bibliography 213
Index 233
Illustrations


2.1 Filippino Lippi, *Allegory of Music*. Reproduced by kind permission of Staatliche Museen zu Berlin, Preussischer Kulturbesitz, Gemäldegalerie

2.2a Cesare Ripa, *Della Novissima Iconologia* [Padua: Tozzi, 1624]. Reproduced by kind permission of the Newberry Library, Chicago


2.4 Robert Fludd, *Utriusque Cosmi Majoris scilicet et Minoris Metaphysica, Physica atque Technica Historia* (Oppenheim: Johann-Theodore de Bry, 1617). Reproduced by kind permission of the Newberry Library, Chicago

2.5 Thomas Salmon, M.A., *An Essay To the Advancement of Musick* (London: J. Macock, 1672). Reproduced by kind permission of the Newberry Library, Chicago

2.6 Jan Brueghel, *Allegory of Hearing*. Reproduced by kind permission of the Museo del Prado, Madrid (All rights reserved © Museo del Prado, Madrid)

2.7 Unknown Dutch artist (c. 1665), *The Yarmouth Collection*. Reproduced by kind permission of the Norfolk Museums Service (Castle Museum Norwich)
Contributors

Linda Phyllis Austern is Associate Professor of Musicology at Northwestern University in Evanston, Illinois. She has published extensively on relationships between music and other fields of intellectual enquiry in sixteenth- and seventeenth-century Europe, particularly England. Her work has been funded by the American Council of Learned Societies, the British Academy and the National Endowment for the Humanities, as well as a variety of private agencies. She is presently finishing a book on music in Elizabethan and early Stuart life and thought.

Ian Biddle graduated from Nottingham University in 1988 and completed his Ph.D. at Newcastle University in 1995. He has also studied composition with Roman Haubenstock-Romati at the Hochschule für Musik in Vienna. Since then he has taught at the University of East Anglia in Norwich and now teaches at Newcastle University. He has recently published articles on contemporary British music, on music theory and aesthetics in the nineteenth century, music historiography and music and gender. He is currently working on a book, *Musics and Masculinities in European Culture, 1800–1900*.


Scott Burnham, Associate Professor of Music at Princeton University, is the author of *Beethoven Hero* (Princeton University Press, 1995) and editor/translator of A. B. Marx, *Musical Form in the Age of Beethoven* (Cambridge University Press, 1997). He and Michael P. Steinberg are co-editing a volume of essays entitled *Beethoven and His World*, to be released on the occasion of the Bard Festival 2000.

Daniel K. L. Chua has taught at St John's College, Cambridge, and King's College London. He is the author of *The 'Galitzin' Quartets of Beethoven*. His study *Absolute Music*
List of Contributors

and the Construction of Meaning has recently been published by Cambridge University Press.

Suzannah Clark recently completed a Junior Research Fellowship at Merton College, Oxford and is now a British Academy Postdoctoral Fellow there. She holds a Ph.D. from Princeton University. Her interests include analysis, the history of theory and Schubert reception, as well as aspects of the thirteenth-century motet.

David E. Cohen received his Ph.D. in music theory from Brandeis University. He has taught at the State University of New York at Stony Brook, Brandeis University and Tufts University, and is currently Assistant Professor of Music at Harvard University. His research focuses on the history of music theory with particular attention to the influence of philosophical and scientific ideas on the development of music-theoretical concepts.

Peter A. Hoyt, Assistant Professor at Wesleyan University, studied at the University of Pennsylvania, where he received his Ph.D. in music theory. Much of his research examines eighteenth- and nineteenth-century accounts of musical form in light of concurrent intellectual influences, such as rhetoric and neoclassical dramatic criticism.

Alexander Rehding is a Research Fellow at Emmanuel College, Cambridge. He received his Ph.D. from Cambridge University. His main research interests are in the field of nineteenth- and twentieth-century music and the history of music theory.
Acknowledgements

The idea for this book was suggested by nature itself. On 16 August 1996, Scott Burnham took us both to a baseball game in the Philadelphia Veterans Stadium (Phillies v. San Francisco Giants). Play had to be stopped when, during sudden torrential rain, lightning struck the stadium, making it impossible for the players to continue. In the face of this powerful display of the force of nature, the idea of hosting a forum for an in-depth discussion of the use of nature in music-theoretical discourse came into our minds. This book, then, grew out of a conference, *Music Theory’s Nature*, which was held at Merton College, Oxford, on 28–29 March 1998. We would like to thank all those who made the conference possible: Jeannette Hudson-Pudwell and the Staff of Merton College, the Music Faculty of Oxford University and the Society for Music Analysis. We are also grateful to John Deathridge, William Drabkin, Jonathan Dunsby and Alan Street, who chaired the sessions at the conference. Sam Thompson provided us with valuable assistance in setting the music examples for this book. We are especially indebted to Penny Souster for her advice and support, which she kindly offered throughout all stages of this project.

S. C. and A. R.