THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO
MEDIEVAL PHILOSOPHY

The Cambridge Companion to Medieval Philosophy takes
its readers into one of the most exciting periods in the history
of philosophy. It spans a millennium of thought extending
from Augustine to Thomas Aquinas and beyond. It includes
not only the thinkers of the Latin West but also the pro-
found contributions of Islamic and Jewish thinkers such
as Avicenna and Maimonides. Leading specialists examine
what it was like to do philosophy in the cultures and in-
stitutions of the Middle Ages and engage all the areas in
which medieval philosophy flourished, including language
and logic, the study of God and being, natural philosophy,
human nature, morality, and politics. The text is supple-
mented with chronological charts, biographies of the major
thinkers, and a guide to the transmission and translation of
medieval texts. The volume will be invaluable for all who
are interested in the philosophical thought of this period.

OTHER VOLUMES IN THE SERIES OF CAMBRIDGE COMPANIONS

AQUINAS *Edited by* NORMAN KRETZMANN *and*
ELEONORE STUMP
HANNAH ARENDT *Edited by* DANA VILLA
ARISTOTLE *Edited by* JONATHAN BARNES
AUGUSTINE *Edited by* ELEONORE STUMP *and*
NORMAN KRETZMANN
BACON *Edited by* MARKKU PELTONEN
SIMONE DE BEAUVOIR *Edited by* CLAUDIA CARD
DARWIN *Edited by* JONATHAN HODGE *and*
GREGORY RADICK
DESCARTES *Edited by* JOHN COTTINGHAM
DUNS SCOTUS *Edited by* THOMAS WILLIAMS
EARLY GREEK PHILOSOPHY *Edited by* A. A. LONG
FEMINISM IN PHILOSOPHY *Edited by* MIRANDA
FRICKER *and* JENNIFER HORNSBY
FOUCAULT *Edited by* GARY GUTTING
FREUD *Edited by* JEROME NEU
GADAMER *Edited by* ROBERT J. DOSTAL
GALILEO *Edited by* PETER MACHAMER
GERMAN IDEALISM *Edited by* KARL AMERIKS
HABERMAS *Edited by* STEPHEN K. WHITE
HEGEL *Edited by* FREDERICK BEISER
HEIDEGGER *Edited by* CHARLES GUIGNON
HOBBES *Edited by* TOM SORELL
HUME *Edited by* DAVID FATE NORTON
HUSSERL *Edited by* BARRY SMITH *and* DAVID
WOODRUFF SMITH
WILLIAM JAMES *Edited by* RUTH ANNA PUTNAM
KANT *Edited by* PAUL GUYER
KIERKEGAARD *Edited by* ALASTAIR HANNAY *and*
GORDON MARINO
LEIBNIZ *Edited by* NICHOLAS JOLLEY
LEVINAS *Edited by* SIMON CRITCHLEY *and*
ROBERT BERNASCONI
LOCKE *Edited by* VERE CHAPPELL
MALEBRANCHE *Edited by* STEVEN NADLER
MARX *Edited by* TERRELL CARVER
MILL *Edited by* JOHN SKORUPSKI

NEWTON   *Edited by* I. BERNARD COHEN *and*
    GEORGE E. SMITH
NIETZSCHE   *Edited by* BERND MAGNUS *and*
    KATHLEEN HIGGINS
OCKHAM   *Edited by* PAUL VINCENT SPADE
PASCAL   *Edited by* NICHOLAS HAMMOND
PLATO   *Edited by* RICHARD KRAUT
PLOTINUS   *Edited by* LLOYD P. GERSON
ROUSSEAU   *Edited by* PATRICK RILEY
SARTRE   *Edited by* CHRISTINA HOWELLS
SCHOPENHAUER   *Edited by* CHRISTOPHER JANAWAY
THE SCOTTISH ENLIGHTENMENT   *Edited by*
    ALEXANDER BROADIE
SPINOZA   *Edited by* DON GARRETT
WITTGENSTEIN   *Edited by* HANS SLUGA *and*
    DAVID STERN

The Cambridge Companion to

MEDIEVAL PHILOSOPHY

Edited by

A. S. McGrade

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
0521000637 - The Cambridge Companion to Medieval Philosophy
Edited by A. S. McGrade
Frontmatter
More information

First published 2003

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

Typeface Trump Medieval 10/13 pt.   *System* LATEX 2$_\varepsilon$ [TB]

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

CONTENTS

vii

viii   Contents

Contents ix

x   Contents

NOTES ON CONTRIBUTORS

E. J. ASHWORTH is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Waterloo, Canada. She is the author of *Language and Logic in the Post-Medieval Period* and of numerous articles on medieval and early modern language and logic. She has edited the *Tractatus de obligationibus* of Paul of Venice's *Logica magna*. She was editor of the Renaissance section of the *Routledge Encyclopedia of Philosophy* and continues as editor of the on-line version.

ANNABEL S. BRETT is Lecturer in History at the University of Cambridge and a Fellow of Gonville and Caius College. Her work in medieval and early modern political thought includes *Liberty, Right and Nature: Individual Rights in Later Scholastic Thought* and an edition of Ockham's *On the Power of Emperors and Princes*. She is now preparing a translation of Marsilius of Padua's *Defender of Peace*.

IDIT DOBBS-WEINSTEIN is Associate Professor of Philosophy at Vanderbilt University. She is the author of *Maimonides and St. Thomas on the Limits of Reason* and an audio book, *Moses Maimonides and Medieval Jewish Philosophy*, as well as many articles on medieval Jewish philosophy, with a special interest in its relations to medieval Islamic and Christian thought and to the philosophy of Spinoza.

THÉRÈSE-ANNE DRUART is Professor of Philosophy and Director of the Center for Medieval and Byzantine Studies at the Catholic University of America. Her recent publications include "The Human Soul's Individuation and its Survival After the Body's Death: Avicenna on the Causal Relation Between Body and Soul." She is

xi

xii   Notes on contributors

preparing a section on metaphysics for *The Cambridge Companion to Arabic Philosophy* and will be directing a continuing bibliography in medieval Islamic philosophy, theology, and the sciences for the Société Internationale des Sciences et de la Philosophie Arabe et Islamique.

P. J. FITZPATRICK is Emeritus Reader in Philosophy at the University of Durham. His writings include *Birth Regulation and Catholic Belief*, *Apologia pro Charles Kingsley*, and *In Breaking of Bread: The Eucharist and Ritual.*

JOHN HALDANE is Professor of Philosophy at the University of St. Andrews, where he is also Senior Fellow of the Centre for Ethics, Philosophy and Public Affairs. He is a Fellow of the Royal Society of Edinburgh and the Royal Society of Arts. Besides editing and coediting several collections of essays, he has written numerous articles on the history of philosophy, philosophy of mind, metaphysics, and moral philosophy, and is coauthor of *Atheism and Theism* in the Blackwell Great Debates in Philosophy series. He will be Gifford Lecturer in Natural Theology at the University of Aberdeen in 2003/4.

BONNIE KENT is Associate Professor of Philosophy at the University of California, Irvine. Since publishing *Virtues of the Will* she has worked especially on issues of motivation in medieval moral psychology. Her recent essays include "Habits and Virtues," in S. Pope, ed., *The Ethics of Aquinas*, and "Rethinking Moral Dispositions," in T. Williams, ed., *The Cambridge Companion to Scotus.*

GYULA KLIMA is Associate Professor of Philosophy at Fordham University. He is the author of *Ars artium: Essays in Philosophical Semantics Medieval and Modern* and numerous articles on medieval logic and metaphysics. He has translated John Buridan's *Summulae de dialectica* and is currently working on a monograph on Buridan's logic and metaphysics.

D. E. LUSCOMBE is a Fellow of the British Academy and Research Professor of Medieval History at the University of Sheffield. He is the author of *The School of Peter Abelard*, *Peter Abelard's Ethics*, *Medieval Thought*, and many articles on Abelard and on medieval

Notes on contributors   xiii

conceptions of hierarchy. He is joint editor, with J. Riley-Smith, of parts 1 and 2 of volume IV of *The New Cambridge Medieval History* (forthcoming) and is currently completing an edition of the *Letters of Peter Abelard and Heloise*.

JAMES MCEVOY is Dean of the Faculty of Philosophy at the National University of Ireland at Maynooth. His special interests in medieval philosophy include Scottus Eriugena, Thomas Gallan, Robert Grosseteste, and the theme of friendship. He is the author of *Robert Grosseteste* (2002) and of two volumes on theories of friendship in antiquity and in the Christian era, *Sagesses de l'amitié* (1997 and 2002). He is a contributor to the edition of Grosseteste's unedited works and is preparing a book on friendship and associated concepts in the history of philosophy.

A. S. MCGRADE is Professor Emeritus of Philosophy, the University of Connecticut, and the author of *The Political Thought of William of Ockham*. He has edited, with John Kilcullen, two volumes of Ockham's political writings and, with John Kilcullen and Matthew Kempshall, volume II of *Cambridge Translations of Medieval Philosophical Texts* (on ethics and political philosophy).

JOHN MARENBON is Fellow and Director of Studies in the History of Philosophy, Trinity College, University of Cambridge. He is the author of a two-volume history of medieval philosophy; *The Philosophy of Peter Abelard*; *Aristotelian Logic, Platonism, and the Context of Early Medieval Philosophy in the West*; and *Boethius*. He is now at work on a new introduction to medieval philosophy (to replace his earlier history) and a study of medieval views of pagans (especially ancient ones).

STEVEN P. MARRONE is Professor of History at Tufts University. His studies of thirteenth-century epistemology include many articles and three monographs, *William of Auvergne and Robert Grosseteste: New Ideas of Truth in the Early Thirteenth Century*, *Truth and Scientific Knowledge in the Thought of Henry of Ghent*, and *The Light of Thy Countenance: Science and Knowledge of God in the Thirteenth Century*.

STEPHEN P. MENN is Associate Professor of Philosophy at McGill University and works on ancient and medieval philosophy and the history of mathematics. He is the author of *Plato on God as Nous* and *Descartes and Augustine*. He is completing a book manuscript on *The Aim and the Argument of Aristotle's* Metaphysics and is working with Calvin Normore on a book about nominalism and realism.

ROBERT PASNAU is Associate Professor of Philosophy at the University of Colorado and the author of *Theories of Cognition in the Later Middle Ages* and *Thomas Aquinas on Human Nature. A Philosophical Study of* Summa Theologiae *1a 75–89*, as well as numerous articles and reviews on topics in late medieval epistemology. He has edited Aquinas's commentary on Aristotle's *De anima* and volume III of *Cambridge Translations of Medieval Philosophical Texts*, on mind and knowledge. He is general editor of the Hackett Aquinas Project, a series of translations, with commentary, of Aquinas's central philosophical texts, and has contributed to that series a volume on Aquinas's treatise on human nature.

EDITH DUDLEY SYLLA is Professor of History at North Carolina State University. She has written extensively on fourteenth-century natural philosophy, especially the work of the Oxford Calculators. She is currently working on Walter Burley's physics and on the origins of mathematical probability, particularly in the work of Jacob Bernouli. Her forthcoming publications include "Business Ethics, Commercial Mathematics, and the Origins of Mathematical Probability" and, with A. Maierù, a short biography of Anneliese Maier.

THOMAS WILLIAMS is Assistant Professor of Philosophy at the University of Iowa. He has translated works by Augustine and Anselm and is now preparing volume v of *Cambridge Translations of Medieval Philosophical Texts*, on philosophical theology. His work on Duns Scotus includes "A Most Methodical Lover? On Scotus's Arbitrary Creator" and the editing of *The Cambridge Companion to Duns Scotus*.

PREFACE

This book presents one of the most exciting periods in the history of philosophy, a millennium of thought extending from Augustine to Wyclif in the Latin West, from al-Kindi to Ibn Rushd in Islam, and in medieval Jewish communities from Ibn Gabirol to Gersonides. As a Companion, the volume seeks to do more than present authoritative information *about* its subject. The contributors aim to take their readers as far as possible *into* medieval philosophy. I explain in the introduction how we hope to achieve this. For now it will be enough to say that we do not assume any prior knowledge of medieval philosophy or the languages in which it was written. We expect that most readers will have had some exposure to contemporary philosophy, but we welcome and hope to assist interested nonphilosophers as well. The volume is meant to be useful in medieval philosophy courses at all levels, but we also have very much in mind those who are approaching medieval philosophy on their own, without access to specialists in the field. We will be delighted if our efforts incite a degree of student agitation for more medieval courses in mainly modernist philosophy departments and if we encourage teachers who skipped or were deprived of the Middle Ages in their own training to offer such courses. It could be a liberating experience for all concerned.

The contributors to this volume have shown great public spirit and enthusiasm for medieval philosophy in setting aside more specialized research in order to make the whole subject accessible to others – not an easy assignment, but, they have found, a rewarding one. I am grateful for their counsel regarding my part in the volume and for their patience and good humor in adjusting their work to suit

xvi   Preface

the common good (most often by cutting out fine material for which there simply is not room). I am happy to thank the reviewers of an early prospectus for this Companion for highly effective criticism and the following for advice and information given along the way: Donald Baxter, Stephen Lahey, Miri Rubin, Paul V. Spade, Eleonore Stump, John Wippel, and Jack Zupko. My debts to Professor B. J. McGrade are easily borne but boundless. Individual contributors wish to acknowledge the advice or inspiration of Julie Allen, Paul Freedman, Ester Macedo, Mrs C. M. L. Smith, and Katherine Tachau. Final thanks are due to the editorial and production staff of Cambridge University Press, and especially to Hilary Gaskin, who has supported and judiciously overseen the volume from start to finish.

A. S. McGrade

ABBREVIATIONS AND FORMS OF REFERENCE

For works cited with a number in square brackets (e.g., Kretzmann [41]), a full reference is given in the bibliography.

a.   article
ad   reply to (ad 1: reply to first objection)
CCAq   *The Cambridge Companion to Thomas Aquinas*,
            ed. N. Kretzmann and E. Stump (Cambridge, 1993)
CCAug   *The Cambridge Companion to Augustine*, ed. E.
            Stump and N. Kretzmann (Cambridge, 2001)
CCOck   *The Cambridge Companion to Ockham*, ed. P. V.
            Spade (Cambridge, 1999)
CCScot   *The Cambridge Companion to Duns Scotus*, ed. T.
            Williams (Cambridge, 2003)
CH12   *A History of Twelfth-Century Western Philosophy*,
            ed. P. Dronke (Cambridge, 1988)
CHLMP   *The Cambridge History of Later Medieval
            Philosophy*, ed. N. Kretzmann *et al.* (Cambridge,
            1982)
CT I–III *The Cambridge Translations of Medieval
            Philosophical Texts*
            I *Logic and the Philosophy of Language*,
               ed. N. Kretzmann and E. Stump (Cambridge,
               1988)
            II *Ethics and Political Philosophy*, ed.
               A. S. McGrade, J. Kilcullen, and M. Kempshall
               (Cambridge, 2001)
            III *Mind and Knowledge*, ed. R. Pasnau
               (Cambridge, 2002)

xvii

xviii   Abbreviations and forms of reference

d.	distinction (in textual references)
obj.	objection
Ordinatio	The text of some or all of a *Sentences* commentary put in order for publication by the author, in contrast with a *reportatio*
PG	*Patrologia graeca*, ed. J. P. Migne, 162 vols. (Paris, 1857–66) (Greek text with Latin translation)
PL	*Patrologia latina*, ed. J. P. Migne, 221 vols. (Paris, 1844–64)
q.	question
q. disp.	disputed question
quodl.	quodlibet
Reportatio	The "reported" form of some or all of a *Sentences* commentary (see p. 330)
ScG	Thomas Aquinas, *Summa contra Gentiles*
Sent.	Peter Lombard, *Sententiae in IV libris distinctae* (Four Books of Sentences), 2 vols. (Grottaferrata, 1971–81) or commentary thereon (see p. 28)
ST	Thomas Aquinas, *Summa theologiae*: references are to the four parts – I, IaIIae (first part of the second part), IIaIIae (second part of the second part), and III
un.	unique (e.g., where a question has only one article)