Measuring the Mind

Is it possible to measure psychological attributes like intelligence, personality, and attitudes and if so, how does that work? What does the term ‘measurement’ mean in a psychological context? This fascinating and timely book discusses these questions and investigates the possible answers that can be given in response. Denny Borsboom provides an in-depth treatment of the philosophical foundations of widely used measurement models in psychology. The theoretical status of classical test theory, latent variable theory, and representational measurement theory are critically evaluated, and positioned in terms of the underlying philosophy of science. Special attention is devoted to the central concept of test validity, and future directions to improve the theory and practice of psychological measurement are outlined.

Denny Borsboom is Assistant Professor of Psychological Methods at the University of Amsterdam. He has published in *Synthese, Applied Psychological Measurement, Psychological Review,* and *Intelligence.*
Measuring the Mind

Conceptual Issues in Contemporary Psychometrics

Denny Borsboom

University of Amsterdam
Contents

Preface vii

1 Introduction 1
   1.1 The measured mind 1
   1.2 Measurement models 3
   1.3 Philosophy of science 5
   1.4 Scope and outline of this book 9

2 True scores 11
   2.1 Introduction 11
   2.2 Three perspectives on true scores 13
      2.2.1 The formal stance 14
      2.2.2 The empirical stance 21
      2.2.3 The ontological stance 30
   2.3 Discussion 44

3 Latent variables 49
   3.1 Introduction 49
   3.2 Three perspectives on latent variables 51
      3.2.1 The formal stance 52
      3.2.2 The empirical stance 56
      3.2.3 The ontological stance 57
   3.3 Implications for psychology 77
   3.4 Discussion 81

4 Scales 85
   4.1 Introduction 85
   4.2 Three perspectives on measurement scales 88
      4.2.1 The formal stance 89
      4.2.2 The empirical stance 95
      4.2.3 The ontological stance 100
   4.3 Discussion 118

5 Relations between the models 121
   5.1 Introduction 121
   5.2 Levels of connection 122
      5.2.1 Syntax 123
      5.2.2 Semantics and ontology 128
vi Contents

5.3 Discussion 133
  5.3.1 Theoretical status 133
  5.3.2 The interpretation of probability 138
  5.3.3 Validity and the relation of measurement 140
  5.3.4 Theoretical consequences 145

6 The concept of validity 149
  6.1 Introduction 149
  6.2 Ontology versus epistemology 151
  6.3 Reference versus meaning 154
  6.4 Causality versus correlation 159
  6.5 Where to look for validity 162
  6.6 Discussion 167

References 173
Index 183
About five decades ago, the visionary Dutch psychologist A. D. De Groot started building an extraordinary academic group at the University of Amsterdam. It consisted of psychometricians, statisticians, philosophers of science, and psychologists with a general methodological orientation. The idea was to approach methodological problems in psychology from the various angles these different specialists brought to the subject matter. By triangulating their viewpoints, methodological problems were to be clarified, pinpointed, and solved. This idea is in several respects the basis for this book. At an intellectual level, the research reported here is carried out exactly along the lines De Groot envisaged, because it applies insights from psychology, philosophy of science, and psychometrics to the problem of psychological measurement. At a more practical level, I think that, if De Groot had not founded this group, the book now before you would not have existed. For the people in the psychological methods department both sparked my interests in psychometrics and philosophy of science, and provided me with the opportunity to start out on the research that is the basis for this book. Hence, I thank De Groot for his vision, and the people in the psychological methods group for creating such a great intellectual atmosphere.

I unfortunately never had the chance to collaborate directly with De Groot; but he did, in the years he spent at the University of Amsterdam, appoint two people who had a direct and substantial influence on all of the work reported here: Don Mellenbergh and Jaap van Heerden, the supervisors of my PhD research. This book is single-authored because I conceived of it and wrote it. But in terms of the genealogy of the ideas that led to this work, and the general spirit in which the research is carried out, I am greatly indebted to these two remarkable men, both for their contributions to my research and for the atmosphere of intellectual freedom they created. Several chapters in this book are partly based on, or use material from, papers we have published jointly. Specifically, the paragraphs on the platonic true score interpretation in chapter 2 are taken from Borsboom and Mellenbergh (2002), chapter 3 is a slightly adapted version
of Borsboom, Mellenbergh, and Van Heerden (2003), and chapter 6 is adapted from Borsboom, Mellenbergh, and Van Heerden (2004). Another person who deserves special mention is Peter Molenaar, who was never directly involved with my research but played a highly stimulating role in the background. With his uncanny ability to connect theoretical insights from distinct areas of mathematics, philosophy, and science, he repeatedly probed me to broaden my intellectual horizon; and his insights on the relation between inter-individual and intra-individual variability were among the primary factors that stimulated the theoretical developments in this book. Also, I would like to thank several people who have, in one way or another, significantly influenced the development of my research: Conor Dolan, Harrie Vorst, Ellen Hamaker, Sanneke Schouwstra, Gitta Lubke, Han van der Maas, Maarten Speekenbrink, Joel Michell, Keith Markus, Dan Cervone, Günter Trendler, Ton Smolenaars, Brian Haig, and Ingmar Visser.

My deepest gratitude extends to those closest to me. I thank my parents for their faith in me; Maaike for being such a wonderful sister; and, above all, Helma for her support and love. This book is dedicated to my son, Kick. I hope that, whatever you will do in this beautiful life, you will do it with passion.